

1
00:00:05,960 --> 00:00:13,690
welcome to the skeptic zone the podcast

2
00:00:09,109 --> 00:00:13,689
from Australia for science and reason

3
00:00:21,640 --> 00:00:27,890
hello and welcome to the skeptic zone

4
00:00:24,379 --> 00:00:30,948
episode number 383 for the 21st of

5
00:00:27,890 --> 00:00:34,909
februari 2016 Richard Saunders here with

6
00:00:30,949 --> 00:00:38,120
you from a secret location a secret

7
00:00:34,909 --> 00:00:41,329
location doing some field work that's

8
00:00:38,119 --> 00:00:42,439
why my voice in this episode is going to

9
00:00:41,329 --> 00:00:45,320
sound a little bit different it's

10
00:00:42,439 --> 00:00:48,259
because well I'm on location yes I know

11
00:00:45,320 --> 00:00:50,539
it sounds very secretive but just roll

12
00:00:48,259 --> 00:00:52,128
with me on this one coming up on this

13
00:00:50,539 --> 00:00:57,228
week's show we're going to be reporting

14
00:00:52,128 --> 00:00:59,838
on the catalyst fiasco now catalyst is

15
00:00:57,228 --> 00:01:03,460
the ABC TV that's the Australian

16
00:00:59,838 --> 00:01:07,099
broadcasting corporation our TVs

17
00:01:03,460 --> 00:01:09,320
flagship science show it's been going

18
00:01:07,099 --> 00:01:11,658
for many years and in fact Dr. Paul

19
00:01:09,319 --> 00:01:14,149
Willis who you hear frequently from the

20
00:01:11,659 --> 00:01:16,990
Royal Institution of Australia was a

21
00:01:14,150 --> 00:01:20,450
long time reporter on Catalyst

22
00:01:16,989 --> 00:01:27,078
unfortunately last week Catalyst ran a

23
00:01:20,450 --> 00:01:29,840
an episode called why fried? which

24
00:01:27,078 --> 00:01:32,809
sadly is more or less a scare mongering

25
00:01:29,840 --> 00:01:35,270
exercise into the dangers or the

26
00:01:32,810 --> 00:01:39,829
so-called dangers or the trumped-up

27
00:01:35,269 --> 00:01:43,280
dangers of cell phones Wi-Fi this sort

28
00:01:39,828 --> 00:01:48,489
of thing the episode has been roundly

29

00:01:43,280 --> 00:01:50,569
condemned by viewers and experts alike

30
00:01:48,489 --> 00:01:53,298
we're going to be getting to that story

31
00:01:50,569 --> 00:01:56,420
pretty soon at the top of the show also

32
00:01:53,299 --> 00:01:59,450
on the show after that it's a radio clip

33
00:01:56,420 --> 00:02:01,280
snip from the BBC featuring michael

34
00:01:59,450 --> 00:02:03,200
marshall our good friend Michael

35
00:02:01,280 --> 00:02:05,388
Marshall from the good thinking Society

36
00:02:03,200 --> 00:02:08,750
in the merseyside skeptics now he was

37
00:02:05,388 --> 00:02:11,289
interviewed on BBC merseyside about

38
00:02:08,750 --> 00:02:16,729
homeopathy together with the GP who is

39
00:02:11,289 --> 00:02:19,189
also a practicing homeopath and thanks

40
00:02:16,729 --> 00:02:21,459
to Michael Marshall for alerting me to

41
00:02:19,189 --> 00:02:24,020
this little clip I think you'll enjoy it

42
00:02:21,459 --> 00:02:26,270
then to round off the show it's evidence

43
00:02:24,020 --> 00:02:28,250

please with Joe alabaster Joe is going

44

00:02:26,270 --> 00:02:30,260

to be reading a report about the north

45

00:02:28,250 --> 00:02:32,239

coast region of New South Wales where a

46

00:02:30,259 --> 00:02:33,568

good friend Heidi Robertson the raw

47

00:02:32,239 --> 00:02:35,340

skeptic from

48

00:02:33,568 --> 00:02:39,030

modern rivers vaccination supporters

49

00:02:35,340 --> 00:02:43,498

group is based and in fact the story

50

00:02:39,030 --> 00:02:46,789

does even quote her well the crux of the

51

00:02:43,498 --> 00:02:49,739

story is looking at why parents are

52

00:02:46,789 --> 00:02:51,870

suspicious of vaccinations and in that

53

00:02:49,739 --> 00:02:53,789

part of the world it's a very important

54

00:02:51,870 --> 00:02:56,129

issue thanks to all those people who

55

00:02:53,789 --> 00:02:58,108

read my little interview on The

56

00:02:56,128 --> 00:03:00,539

Huffington Post australia and i'll link

57

00:02:58,109 --> 00:03:02,669

that in the show notes it was well my

58
00:03:00,539 --> 00:03:05,248
tips and advice for any budding

59
00:03:02,669 --> 00:03:07,919
podcaster out there take it or leave it

60
00:03:05,248 --> 00:03:10,530
things that should have worked for me

61
00:03:07,919 --> 00:03:12,299
more or less in the skeptic zone now

62
00:03:10,530 --> 00:03:15,209
thanks to all those people who chip in

63
00:03:12,299 --> 00:03:18,239
chip into the skeptic zone via paypal

64
00:03:15,209 --> 00:03:21,180
you can do that at skeptic zone TV a lot

65
00:03:18,239 --> 00:03:23,878
of people chip in 99 cents a week but it

66
00:03:21,180 --> 00:03:26,609
all helps it really does it covers the

67
00:03:23,878 --> 00:03:28,798
basic costs of putting the show out and

68
00:03:26,609 --> 00:03:30,919
i hope you enjoy it but now it's time

69
00:03:28,799 --> 00:03:34,199
for me to run to the secret location

70
00:03:30,919 --> 00:03:36,719
covered open it up find some rice

71
00:03:34,199 --> 00:03:40,849
crackers munch those well I'm doing that

72
00:03:36,718 --> 00:03:40,848
I hope you enjoy the skeptic zone

73
00:03:42,930 --> 00:03:44,989
you

74
00:04:01,939 --> 00:04:08,039
earlier last week abc-tv's catalyst

75
00:04:05,610 --> 00:04:13,800
their flagship science show add a

76
00:04:08,039 --> 00:04:18,029
program called why fried ? all about the

77
00:04:13,800 --> 00:04:21,449
supposed dangers of Wi-Fi radiation cell

78
00:04:18,029 --> 00:04:24,989
phone radiation affecting the brain here

79
00:04:21,449 --> 00:04:27,709
is a short clip used at the beginning of

80
00:04:24,990 --> 00:04:27,710
the report

81
00:04:34,538 --> 00:04:41,269
you can't see it or hear it but Wi-Fi

82
00:04:38,689 --> 00:04:45,409
blankets our homes our cities and our

83
00:04:41,269 --> 00:04:47,598
schools children today are growing up in

84
00:04:45,408 --> 00:04:50,418
a sea of radio frequency microwave

85
00:04:47,598 --> 00:04:56,149
radiation that did not exist five years

86

00:04:50,418 --> 00:04:57,978
ago our safety agencies dispute that

87
00:04:56,149 --> 00:05:01,128
wireless devices like mobile phones

88
00:04:57,978 --> 00:05:03,408
cause harm I don't think it's good

89
00:05:01,129 --> 00:05:06,439
enough to say at the moment that mobile

90
00:05:03,408 --> 00:05:09,259
phone used us cause that's cause cancer

91
00:05:06,439 --> 00:05:10,639
cell phones Amit post radiation edges

92
00:05:09,259 --> 00:05:13,129
but some of the world's leading

93
00:05:10,639 --> 00:05:15,819
scientists and industry insiders are

94
00:05:13,129 --> 00:05:19,129
breaking ranks to warn us of the risks

95
00:05:15,819 --> 00:05:23,689
there is an association between heavy

96
00:05:19,129 --> 00:05:25,158
mobile phone use and brain tumors I've

97
00:05:23,689 --> 00:05:27,139
been in their technology in show my

98
00:05:25,158 --> 00:05:30,348
career and I seen a tremendous benefits

99
00:05:27,139 --> 00:05:33,710
the technology can provide my concern is

100
00:05:30,348 --> 00:05:36,528

snow buddy can say that it's safe dude

101

00:05:33,709 --> 00:05:39,500

mobile phones cause brain cancer and is

102

00:05:36,528 --> 00:05:41,300

Wi-Fi making us sick in this episode I

103

00:05:39,500 --> 00:05:43,639

investigate the latest research and

104

00:05:41,300 --> 00:05:46,569

advice about the safety of our modern

105

00:05:43,639 --> 00:05:46,569

wireless devices

106

00:05:49,220 --> 00:05:54,060

dramatic music scaremongering we might

107

00:05:52,290 --> 00:05:57,930

say it's the flavor of the whole show

108

00:05:54,060 --> 00:05:59,730

the whole report now I will add the link

109

00:05:57,930 --> 00:06:03,090

to the video and the transcript the

110

00:05:59,730 --> 00:06:05,670

entire report for you to peruse if you

111

00:06:03,089 --> 00:06:07,109

so desire needless to say this report

112

00:06:05,670 --> 00:06:10,110

has come in for a huge amount of

113

00:06:07,110 --> 00:06:13,050

criticism I refer to report such as the

114

00:06:10,110 --> 00:06:16,980

one by Cigna Dean writing for the SBS

115
00:06:13,050 --> 00:06:21,480
website expert audience slam ABC's

116
00:06:16,980 --> 00:06:23,040
catalyst report on Wi-Fi danger science

117
00:06:21,480 --> 00:06:25,800
and health experts are slamming the

118
00:06:23,040 --> 00:06:27,450
latest episode of ABC's catalyst on the

119
00:06:25,800 --> 00:06:30,329
potential health dangers of wireless

120
00:06:27,449 --> 00:06:33,449
devices calling it scare mongering and

121
00:06:30,329 --> 00:06:35,430
incorrect very good and thorough report

122
00:06:33,449 --> 00:06:38,159
by Cigna Dean and I'll link to that in

123
00:06:35,430 --> 00:06:39,720
the show notes other outlets chiming in

124
00:06:38,160 --> 00:06:43,439
with criticism include the sydney

125
00:06:39,720 --> 00:06:46,110
morning herald the conversation and the

126
00:06:43,439 --> 00:06:49,079
australian skeptics now later on I'll

127
00:06:46,110 --> 00:06:52,020
read the bent spoon nomination for

128
00:06:49,079 --> 00:06:53,879
catalyst by Australian skeptics but

129
00:06:52,019 --> 00:06:56,279
right now what I'm going to do is run a

130
00:06:53,879 --> 00:06:59,219
report from our good friends at the

131
00:06:56,279 --> 00:07:01,349
Royal Institution of Australia and

132
00:06:59,220 --> 00:07:05,250
immediately following that report I'll

133
00:07:01,350 --> 00:07:08,300
read out the bent spoon nomination from

134
00:07:05,250 --> 00:07:08,300
Australian skeptics

135
00:07:08,420 --> 00:07:15,230
now those wonderful people at the Royal

136
00:07:10,850 --> 00:07:19,640
Institution of Australia www r-ia us ova

137
00:07:15,230 --> 00:07:21,410
you have a new initiative a new

138
00:07:19,639 --> 00:07:23,240
initiative when you say that yes I

139
00:07:21,410 --> 00:07:28,370
suppose you can look out it's

140
00:07:23,240 --> 00:07:33,139
Australia's science channel go to www RI

141
00:07:28,370 --> 00:07:35,180
a u.s. TV now there's a host of videos

142
00:07:33,139 --> 00:07:36,860
up there already but the one we're

143

00:07:35,180 --> 00:07:40,100
playing you today is in line with our

144
00:07:36,860 --> 00:07:43,100
current story about the catalyst Wi-Fi

145
00:07:40,100 --> 00:07:47,060
program in response to the ABC catalyst

146
00:07:43,100 --> 00:07:49,220
airing why fried are ayahs spoke to

147
00:07:47,060 --> 00:07:51,050
Professor Rodney Croft from the

148
00:07:49,220 --> 00:07:53,990
University of Wollongong who is an

149
00:07:51,050 --> 00:07:56,689
expert on electromagnetic effects and

150
00:07:53,990 --> 00:07:59,210
human health to seek the truth about

151
00:07:56,689 --> 00:08:02,180
this myth and now from the Royal

152
00:07:59,209 --> 00:08:06,019
Institution of Australia it's Ben and

153
00:08:02,180 --> 00:08:08,180
Kasey so we're pretty sick seeing our

154
00:08:06,019 --> 00:08:10,699
feed spam today about the dangers of

155
00:08:08,180 --> 00:08:12,560
Wi-Fi yeah this week's episode of

156
00:08:10,699 --> 00:08:14,539
catalyst was the one to launch a million

157
00:08:12,560 --> 00:08:16,790

I rolls around our office when in fact

158

00:08:14,540 --> 00:08:18,980

this issue breaks down pretty simply

159

00:08:16,790 --> 00:08:21,200

yeah at its core there's actually no

160

00:08:18,980 --> 00:08:24,410

evidence which shows any link between

161

00:08:21,199 --> 00:08:26,779

our Wi-Fi and mobile phones and serious

162

00:08:24,410 --> 00:08:29,390

ill effects on our health there's really

163

00:08:26,779 --> 00:08:32,089

no evidence at all that there's a link

164

00:08:29,389 --> 00:08:34,819

between Wi-Fi use and health there's

165

00:08:32,090 --> 00:08:38,030

been a lot of research conducted but

166

00:08:34,820 --> 00:08:40,280

it's a very low power level and we just

167

00:08:38,029 --> 00:08:42,679

can't find any link with health in

168

00:08:40,279 --> 00:08:45,559

general we've got very flat rates of

169

00:08:42,679 --> 00:08:47,449

brain cancers for instance so we do see

170

00:08:45,559 --> 00:08:49,879

little changes but they're not actually

171

00:08:47,450 --> 00:08:52,009

related to mobile phones what we find

172
00:08:49,879 --> 00:08:53,779
for instance with rats is that they

173
00:08:52,009 --> 00:08:55,700
change their eating behaviour very

174
00:08:53,779 --> 00:08:59,179
slightly they become a little bit less

175
00:08:55,700 --> 00:09:02,600
hungry so that's the threshold that we

176
00:08:59,179 --> 00:09:05,569
refer to as a health effect now in terms

177
00:09:02,600 --> 00:09:09,190
of Wi-Fi what we're talking about is a

178
00:09:05,570 --> 00:09:12,110
level about five to five thousand to

179
00:09:09,190 --> 00:09:15,980
50,000 times lower than that so

180
00:09:12,110 --> 00:09:18,860
extremely extremely small levels that we

181
00:09:15,980 --> 00:09:21,740
would find very hard to actually detect

182
00:09:18,860 --> 00:09:24,710
in terms of a biological change

183
00:09:21,740 --> 00:09:27,049
radiation like this changes temperature

184
00:09:24,710 --> 00:09:29,750
and that's how it can have an influence

185
00:09:27,049 --> 00:09:32,359
at very high levels but at the kind of

186
00:09:29,750 --> 00:09:35,269
level we get from a Wi-Fi for instance

187
00:09:32,360 --> 00:09:37,190
we'd find it very hard to actually see

188
00:09:35,269 --> 00:09:39,799
any temperature change in the body at

189
00:09:37,190 --> 00:09:42,170
all and our body is very used to dealing

190
00:09:39,799 --> 00:09:44,179
with quite large temperature changes and

191
00:09:42,169 --> 00:09:46,039
any claims that kids are more

192
00:09:44,179 --> 00:09:47,839
susceptible than adults well we just

193
00:09:46,039 --> 00:09:51,379
can't prove that there are slight

194
00:09:47,840 --> 00:09:53,840
changes in how small people versus

195
00:09:51,379 --> 00:09:56,990
larger people absorb the energy from

196
00:09:53,840 --> 00:09:59,090
Wi-Fi or mobile phones but these don't

197
00:09:56,990 --> 00:10:02,659
correspond to anything to do with health

198
00:09:59,090 --> 00:10:05,210
so you can get slightly larger exposures

199
00:10:02,659 --> 00:10:08,360
but on the other hand a smaller person

200

00:10:05,210 --> 00:10:10,820
will also give off more heat and produce

201
00:10:08,360 --> 00:10:14,090
a compensatory effect that means the net

202
00:10:10,820 --> 00:10:16,760
result is no change so an adult and a

203
00:10:14,090 --> 00:10:19,280
child as far as science has been able to

204
00:10:16,759 --> 00:10:21,409
determine are identical in terms of the

205
00:10:19,279 --> 00:10:24,169
effect of radiation from mobile phones

206
00:10:21,409 --> 00:10:25,969
and Wi-Fi there's just no evidence that

207
00:10:24,169 --> 00:10:27,649
making a call on your mobile phone or

208
00:10:25,970 --> 00:10:29,600
hooking up to your Wi-Fi will mean that

209
00:10:27,649 --> 00:10:31,970
you get cancer now this whole episode

210
00:10:29,600 --> 00:10:35,090
was just about playing up to the fears

211
00:10:31,970 --> 00:10:38,300
of your parents some people expect

212
00:10:35,090 --> 00:10:41,509
science to be able to give us a hundred

213
00:10:38,299 --> 00:10:44,149
percent secure answer that something is

214
00:10:41,509 --> 00:10:47,210

safe and they'd like to see that before

215

00:10:44,149 --> 00:10:50,389

they're willing to have sort of society

216

00:10:47,210 --> 00:10:53,150

use a product a food and a mission

217

00:10:50,389 --> 00:10:55,580

whatever it may be but science can't do

218

00:10:53,149 --> 00:10:57,139

that science can never ever show that

219

00:10:55,580 --> 00:10:59,680

something is a hundred percent safe

220

00:10:57,139 --> 00:11:02,480

doesn't matter if its water orange juice

221

00:10:59,679 --> 00:11:04,549

Wi-Fi or a mobile phone it just can't

222

00:11:02,480 --> 00:11:07,639

show that so really it's a matter of

223

00:11:04,549 --> 00:11:09,139

looking to try to find harm and that's

224

00:11:07,639 --> 00:11:11,120

what the research has really been doing

225

00:11:09,139 --> 00:11:14,870

there's been a huge amount of research

226

00:11:11,120 --> 00:11:17,360

out there trying to find harm and at the

227

00:11:14,870 --> 00:11:19,669

moment we can't find any you can never

228

00:11:17,360 --> 00:11:21,830

been 100% sure about things like this

229
00:11:19,669 --> 00:11:24,620
since those fuzzy edges which people

230
00:11:21,830 --> 00:11:26,360
exploit fear mongering the episode ended

231
00:11:24,620 --> 00:11:29,720
with the guest asking do we really want

232
00:11:26,360 --> 00:11:31,700
to see proof yes yes we do we really

233
00:11:29,720 --> 00:11:33,889
want to see proof we really want to see

234
00:11:31,700 --> 00:11:34,850
evidence that's how we want to make our

235
00:11:33,889 --> 00:11:36,708
decisions

236
00:11:34,850 --> 00:11:39,259
and I find it a bit irresponsible to

237
00:11:36,708 --> 00:11:41,419
enter the entire episode this way and

238
00:11:39,259 --> 00:11:43,430
I'm kind of just as disappointed in the

239
00:11:41,419 --> 00:11:45,409
journalism as I am in the standards of

240
00:11:43,429 --> 00:11:47,599
science that we saw I think we should

241
00:11:45,409 --> 00:11:50,169
all expect more from a report on

242
00:11:47,600 --> 00:11:50,170
catalyst

243
00:12:01,818 --> 00:12:08,038
bent spoon nomination for ABC catalyst

244
00:12:05,548 --> 00:12:11,519
by Tim mendon published on the

245
00:12:08,038 --> 00:12:18,149
Australian skeptics website at wwc

246
00:12:11,519 --> 00:12:20,489
optics com au februari 19th 2016 ABC TV

247
00:12:18,149 --> 00:12:22,828
science program catalyst and one of its

248
00:12:20,489 --> 00:12:25,168
chief science reporters dr. Mary and

249
00:12:22,828 --> 00:12:27,298
Maisy have been nominated for the

250
00:12:25,168 --> 00:12:29,879
Australian skeptics bent spoon award a

251
00:12:27,298 --> 00:12:33,899
report by dr. Mary and amazed he titled

252
00:12:29,879 --> 00:12:36,979
why fried and broadcast on februari 16

253
00:12:33,899 --> 00:12:39,328
looked at be supposed health dangers of

254
00:12:36,979 --> 00:12:43,859
Wi-Fi connections for smartphones

255
00:12:39,328 --> 00:12:46,438
laptops tablets etc the program and dr.

256
00:12:43,859 --> 00:12:48,720
Demasi have been criticized before for

257

00:12:46,438 --> 00:12:53,158
promoting unsubstantiated scientific

258
00:12:48,720 --> 00:12:55,528
evidence of dangerous products in 2014

259
00:12:53,158 --> 00:12:58,259
dr. demacian catalyst presented a case

260
00:12:55,528 --> 00:13:00,889
against statins in cholesterol control

261
00:12:58,259 --> 00:13:03,989
the program was criticized for using

262
00:13:00,889 --> 00:13:06,479
experts with vested interests in

263
00:13:03,989 --> 00:13:09,119
promoting alternative medicine to put

264
00:13:06,479 --> 00:13:11,249
the anti statin case and pitching the

265
00:13:09,119 --> 00:13:14,879
proponents of established evidence-based

266
00:13:11,249 --> 00:13:17,009
medicine into a minor role this time the

267
00:13:14,879 --> 00:13:19,528
same process has been used to alert

268
00:13:17,009 --> 00:13:23,399
people to the dangers of sticking

269
00:13:19,528 --> 00:13:26,099
smartphones to their ears it uses six

270
00:13:23,399 --> 00:13:28,798
experts at least one without any

271
00:13:26,099 --> 00:13:31,470

attribution to put the case for the

272

00:13:28,798 --> 00:13:32,639

supposed dangers and only one scientist

273

00:13:31,470 --> 00:13:34,979

who pointed to the lack of any

274

00:13:32,639 --> 00:13:37,168

scientific evidence that supports the

275

00:13:34,979 --> 00:13:38,849

danger claims even that science was

276

00:13:37,168 --> 00:13:40,798

encouraged to state that science was

277

00:13:38,849 --> 00:13:43,169

never one hundred percent sure of

278

00:13:40,798 --> 00:13:46,139

something which in the program's point

279

00:13:43,168 --> 00:13:47,759

of view equated to quote you can't

280

00:13:46,139 --> 00:13:50,009

therefore say it's one hundred percent

281

00:13:47,759 --> 00:13:51,989

safe and therefore it must be dangerous

282

00:13:50,009 --> 00:13:54,239

end quote in response to the criticism

283

00:13:51,989 --> 00:13:57,869

catalyst responded on its Facebook page

284

00:13:54,239 --> 00:14:00,449

that quote the program and its producers

285

00:13:57,869 --> 00:14:02,819

recognized there's a debate understand

286
00:14:00,448 --> 00:14:06,568
that the science is not settled and that

287
00:14:02,818 --> 00:14:08,849
it is an issue of public concern that's

288
00:14:06,568 --> 00:14:11,728
why the catalyst program spoke to those

289
00:14:08,850 --> 00:14:12,790
who consider the increased risk to be

290
00:14:11,729 --> 00:14:15,129
significant

291
00:14:12,789 --> 00:14:17,860
and concerning and to others who do not

292
00:14:15,129 --> 00:14:20,620
consider it to be significant including

293
00:14:17,860 --> 00:14:26,649
extensive quotes from a spokesman for

294
00:14:20,620 --> 00:14:29,679
the ARP ans a and the industry body AMTA

295
00:14:26,649 --> 00:14:32,769
the program also included the views of a

296
00:14:29,679 --> 00:14:35,589
prominent brain surgeon Charlie Teo and

297
00:14:32,769 --> 00:14:38,289
prominent cancer expert Professor Bruce

298
00:14:35,590 --> 00:14:40,149
Armstrong it is also important to note

299
00:14:38,289 --> 00:14:43,149
that at least two of the current critics

300
00:14:40,149 --> 00:14:45,819
of the program doctors Bernhard Stuart

301
00:14:43,149 --> 00:14:47,829
and Simon Chapman were invited to

302
00:14:45,820 --> 00:14:50,590
participate in the program but declined

303
00:14:47,830 --> 00:14:52,509
and they agreed to be interviewed their

304
00:14:50,590 --> 00:14:55,120
views would have been included as well

305
00:14:52,509 --> 00:14:57,340
end quote perhaps because of the claim

306
00:14:55,120 --> 00:14:59,679
that quote the science is not settled

307
00:14:57,340 --> 00:15:02,080
and quote the catalyst story allowed

308
00:14:59,679 --> 00:15:04,269
many unsubstantiated statements that

309
00:15:02,080 --> 00:15:07,259
ignored scientific evidence to be made

310
00:15:04,269 --> 00:15:10,419
and some of those statements were wrong

311
00:15:07,259 --> 00:15:13,960
dr. Sara Loren of the University of

312
00:15:10,419 --> 00:15:16,559
Wollongong a researcher at the nhr mcs

313
00:15:13,960 --> 00:15:18,850
center for research excellence in

314

00:15:16,559 --> 00:15:21,279
electromagnetic energy as well as a

315
00:15:18,850 --> 00:15:24,340
member of the WHO environmental health

316
00:15:21,279 --> 00:15:27,759
criterion evaluation committee on radio

317
00:15:24,340 --> 00:15:29,710
frequency fields said that quote many

318
00:15:27,759 --> 00:15:32,049
claims were made without providing any

319
00:15:29,710 --> 00:15:34,540
substantiated science to support what

320
00:15:32,049 --> 00:15:36,759
was essentially individual and selective

321
00:15:34,539 --> 00:15:38,980
opinions that were used to paint an

322
00:15:36,759 --> 00:15:41,500
incorrect picture of the current state

323
00:15:38,980 --> 00:15:43,899
of knowledge indeed there is currently

324
00:15:41,500 --> 00:15:46,419
no scientific evidence that exposure to

325
00:15:43,899 --> 00:15:49,059
low-level radio frequency such as

326
00:15:46,419 --> 00:15:51,579
emitted by mobile phones and Wi-Fi has

327
00:15:49,059 --> 00:15:53,799
an impact on health by not providing a

328
00:15:51,580 --> 00:15:55,180

balanced view on the science catalyst

329

00:15:53,799 --> 00:15:57,699
has left viewers with misleading

330

00:15:55,179 --> 00:16:00,849
messages regarding the use of such

331

00:15:57,700 --> 00:16:03,280
devices which may serve to perpetuate

332

00:16:00,850 --> 00:16:06,220
fear related to a health risk that

333

00:16:03,279 --> 00:16:08,799
currently does not exist unquote dr.

334

00:16:06,220 --> 00:16:10,960
devra Davis an American epidemiologist

335

00:16:08,799 --> 00:16:13,179
and writer who was featured prominently

336

00:16:10,960 --> 00:16:15,220
in the program countered the lack of

337

00:16:13,179 --> 00:16:18,009
scientific evidence for brain damage

338

00:16:15,220 --> 00:16:21,009
from Wi-Fi radiation by saying it was

339

00:16:18,009 --> 00:16:24,159
too early to see any rise in brain

340

00:16:21,009 --> 00:16:26,318
cancer caused by mobile phones or Wi-Fi

341

00:16:24,159 --> 00:16:28,778
and argued that brain cancers after the

342

00:16:26,318 --> 00:16:31,838
Japanese atomic bombs did not appear for

343
00:16:28,778 --> 00:16:35,588
40 years quote that's simply incorrect

344
00:16:31,839 --> 00:16:37,180
in quote said dr. Simon Chapman emeritus

345
00:16:35,589 --> 00:16:39,879
professor in public health at the

346
00:16:37,179 --> 00:16:42,489
University of Sydney he cited a study

347
00:16:39,879 --> 00:16:44,769
published by the american cancer society

348
00:16:42,490 --> 00:16:47,560
that reported on central nervous system

349
00:16:44,769 --> 00:16:49,659
cancers including brain cancers in those

350
00:16:47,559 --> 00:16:51,969
exposed to atomic bomb radiation in

351
00:16:49,659 --> 00:16:53,588
Japan which found that more than fifty

352
00:16:51,970 --> 00:16:56,379
eight percent of those studied were

353
00:16:53,589 --> 00:16:59,410
diagnosed in the first forty years and

354
00:16:56,379 --> 00:17:02,579
some much earlier quote there is no

355
00:16:59,409 --> 00:17:05,828
evidence of any increase in the rate per

356
00:17:02,578 --> 00:17:08,918
100,000 population of brain cancer in

357
00:17:05,828 --> 00:17:11,198
any age group in Australia from 1982 to

358
00:17:08,919 --> 00:17:13,538
the present other than for the very

359
00:17:11,199 --> 00:17:15,490
oldest age group where the increased

360
00:17:13,538 --> 00:17:18,490
started well before mobile phones were

361
00:17:15,490 --> 00:17:21,370
introduced in Australia and so cannot be

362
00:17:18,490 --> 00:17:23,859
explained by mobile phones all cancers

363
00:17:21,369 --> 00:17:26,408
in Australia are notifiable and over

364
00:17:23,859 --> 00:17:29,469
eighty-five percent of brain cancer is

365
00:17:26,409 --> 00:17:32,590
historically verified it's just not a

366
00:17:29,470 --> 00:17:34,808
doctor's opinion and quote dr. Darren

367
00:17:32,589 --> 00:17:37,178
Saunders is a cancer biologist at the

368
00:17:34,808 --> 00:17:39,220
University of New South Wales and is a

369
00:17:37,179 --> 00:17:42,159
visiting fellow at Big Kinghorn Cancer

370
00:17:39,220 --> 00:17:44,079
Center Garvan Institute he said that

371

00:17:42,159 --> 00:17:45,789
there were key flaws in the argument

372
00:17:44,079 --> 00:17:48,399
made in the program that stood out

373
00:17:45,788 --> 00:17:50,980
significantly one was the lack of any

374
00:17:48,400 --> 00:17:54,429
demonstratable increase in brain cancer

375
00:17:50,980 --> 00:17:57,269
incidents over time quote we have been

376
00:17:54,429 --> 00:17:59,740
exposed to the same kind of non ionizing

377
00:17:57,269 --> 00:18:01,629
electromagnetic radiation long before

378
00:17:59,740 --> 00:18:04,480
mobile phones and Wi-Fi became

379
00:18:01,630 --> 00:18:07,030
commonplace men quote he added that a

380
00:18:04,480 --> 00:18:09,819
second floor was the absence of a

381
00:18:07,029 --> 00:18:12,369
plausible biological mechanism for how

382
00:18:09,819 --> 00:18:15,158
this kind of radiation can cause cancer

383
00:18:12,369 --> 00:18:17,558
quote there were very poor analogues

384
00:18:15,159 --> 00:18:20,080
made with microwave ovens and smoking

385
00:18:17,558 --> 00:18:22,599

which are purely emotive and not based

386

00:18:20,079 --> 00:18:24,879

on actual science comparing a microwave

387

00:18:22,599 --> 00:18:27,339

to a mobile phone is like comparing a

388

00:18:24,880 --> 00:18:30,400

Saturn 5 rocket to your lawnmower and

389

00:18:27,339 --> 00:18:33,099

quote for a supposed scientific program

390

00:18:30,400 --> 00:18:35,769

one sequence in particular was

391

00:18:33,099 --> 00:18:37,730

indicative of poor scientific support

392

00:18:35,769 --> 00:18:40,670

for the radiation claims

393

00:18:37,730 --> 00:18:43,250

dr. Davis used illustrations to explain

394

00:18:40,670 --> 00:18:45,410

the supposed to the extent of radiation

395

00:18:43,250 --> 00:18:48,230

damage to the brain but these were

396

00:18:45,410 --> 00:18:50,390

obviously photolibrary shots of a man

397

00:18:48,230 --> 00:18:52,640

and little girl with colors superimposed

398

00:18:50,390 --> 00:18:55,340

on them the program said this showed

399

00:18:52,640 --> 00:18:57,680

thermal imagery of radiation seeping

400
00:18:55,339 --> 00:18:59,449
into the brain but this imagery could

401
00:18:57,680 --> 00:19:02,120
have easily been applied to any object

402
00:18:59,450 --> 00:19:05,390
it was not generated by those particular

403
00:19:02,119 --> 00:19:08,509
subjects nonetheless dr. Demasi seemed

404
00:19:05,390 --> 00:19:12,430
impressed by the colors the bent spoon

405
00:19:08,509 --> 00:19:15,470
nomination says quote for again

406
00:19:12,430 --> 00:19:17,900
presenting a biased sensationalist story

407
00:19:15,470 --> 00:19:20,180
on the scientific topic in this case

408
00:19:17,900 --> 00:19:22,730
non-ionizing radiation and the use of

409
00:19:20,180 --> 00:19:25,430
Wi-Fi media the program had six

410
00:19:22,730 --> 00:19:27,650
scaremongering experts ranged against

411
00:19:25,430 --> 00:19:29,779
one scientist saying that there wasn't

412
00:19:27,650 --> 00:19:32,810
any scientific evidence that harm was

413
00:19:29,779 --> 00:19:35,420
being caused it confused the proper and

414
00:19:32,809 --> 00:19:36,889
normal scientific restraint of saying we

415
00:19:35,420 --> 00:19:39,019
can't be absolutely sure of something

416
00:19:36,890 --> 00:19:42,080
with admitting that something is

417
00:19:39,019 --> 00:19:44,930
dangerous poor science bad journalism

418
00:19:42,079 --> 00:19:48,559
overly alarmist and even the title of

419
00:19:44,930 --> 00:19:51,980
the story wife ride was sensationalized

420
00:19:48,559 --> 00:19:55,129
move / Daily Mail here comes catalyst

421
00:19:51,980 --> 00:20:04,460
and that was by Tim mendham as reported

422
00:19:55,130 --> 00:20:06,890
at ww skeptics com a you so there you

423
00:20:04,460 --> 00:20:10,579
are a little round up of this week's hot

424
00:20:06,890 --> 00:20:12,140
topic why fried from the catalyst

425
00:20:10,579 --> 00:20:15,289
program and I think one of the reasons

426
00:20:12,140 --> 00:20:18,680
so many people are so disappointed is

427
00:20:15,289 --> 00:20:22,279
because that well basically we simply

428

00:20:18,680 --> 00:20:23,710
expect better from the ABC and the

429
00:20:22,279 --> 00:20:26,740
catalyst program

430
00:20:23,710 --> 00:20:30,159
for the links mentioned visit www.a.pegsonline.com

431
00:20:26,740 --> 00:20:37,210
on TV and it's worth mentioning that the

432
00:20:30,159 --> 00:20:39,940
patched people p8 TCH apostrophe D who

433
00:20:37,210 --> 00:20:41,679
are marketing a little device you put on

434
00:20:39,940 --> 00:20:45,250
your cell phone to protect you from the

435
00:20:41,679 --> 00:20:47,048
evil radiation jumped in early when they

436
00:20:45,250 --> 00:20:49,210
saw the catalyst program was coming up

437
00:20:47,048 --> 00:20:54,250
and if you go to their Facebook page

438
00:20:49,210 --> 00:20:58,048
you'll see certain comments by a certain

439
00:20:54,250 --> 00:20:58,048
mmm podcaster

440
00:21:13,730 --> 00:21:20,880
dr. Harriet hall md no into thousands as

441
00:21:17,819 --> 00:21:24,000
the skeptic a retired family physician

442
00:21:20,880 --> 00:21:26,039

and former Air Force flight surgeon she

443

00:21:24,000 --> 00:21:27,740

writes about medicine so called

444

00:21:26,038 --> 00:21:31,640

complementary and alternative medicine

445

00:21:27,740 --> 00:21:34,710

science banchory and critical thinking

446

00:21:31,640 --> 00:21:37,169

Harriet now has a free course a series

447

00:21:34,710 --> 00:21:40,319

of ten video lectures on science based

448

00:21:37,169 --> 00:21:42,360

medicine and alternative medicine the

449

00:21:40,319 --> 00:21:44,460

videos and an accompanying course guide

450

00:21:42,359 --> 00:21:49,319

can be found by following the link at

451

00:21:44,460 --> 00:21:53,870

skip dot info or by visiting web Randy's

452

00:21:49,319 --> 00:21:57,649

org slash educational dash modules dot

453

00:21:53,869 --> 00:21:59,908

HTML topics covered in the series are

454

00:21:57,650 --> 00:22:03,019

science-based medicine vs.

455

00:21:59,909 --> 00:22:06,440

evidence-based medicine what is cam

456

00:22:03,019 --> 00:22:09,629

chiropractic acupuncture homeopathy

457
00:22:06,440 --> 00:22:11,759
naturopathy and herbal medicine energy

458
00:22:09,630 --> 00:22:14,940
medicine miscellaneous alternatives

459
00:22:11,759 --> 00:22:18,200
pitfalls in research and science-based

460
00:22:14,940 --> 00:22:21,000
medicine in the media and politics

461
00:22:18,200 --> 00:22:23,548
Harriet covers each topic in a matter of

462
00:22:21,000 --> 00:22:29,240
fact no-nonsense way that sure to

463
00:22:23,548 --> 00:22:29,240
educate and entertain skeptic dot info

464
00:22:48,160 --> 00:22:53,090
and now here's a clip from the

465
00:22:50,390 --> 00:22:55,670
Merseyside skeptics well I should say

466
00:22:53,089 --> 00:22:57,679
it's from BBC merseyside they

467
00:22:55,670 --> 00:22:59,150
interviewed Michael Marshall from the

468
00:22:57,680 --> 00:23:02,420
Merseyside skeptics and the good

469
00:22:59,150 --> 00:23:05,300
thinking society as well as dr. hugh

470
00:23:02,420 --> 00:23:08,600
nielsen a medical doctor who also

471
00:23:05,299 --> 00:23:11,559
practices homeopathy don't forget to

472
00:23:08,599 --> 00:23:14,929
visit good thinking society org or

473
00:23:11,559 --> 00:23:16,639
merseyside skeptics or but UK for more

474
00:23:14,930 --> 00:23:18,769
information about Michael Marshall and

475
00:23:16,640 --> 00:23:21,740
the group's he's involved with now I

476
00:23:18,769 --> 00:23:25,369
have a closed listen to the reasoning

477
00:23:21,740 --> 00:23:29,660
but dr. hugh nielsen presents in this

478
00:23:25,369 --> 00:23:31,879
interview change your takia health buses

479
00:23:29,660 --> 00:23:33,529
in liverpool and merle a considering

480
00:23:31,880 --> 00:23:36,290
stopping spending money on homeopathy

481
00:23:33,529 --> 00:23:38,109
currently we're all spend about 31,000

482
00:23:36,289 --> 00:23:40,670
pounds on it liverpool roughly the same

483
00:23:38,109 --> 00:23:41,959
totally in terms of the NHS budget it

484
00:23:40,670 --> 00:23:44,539
amounts to naught point naught naught

485

00:23:41,960 --> 00:23:45,710
four percent of the entire budget but

486
00:23:44,539 --> 00:23:47,420
some people think we shouldn't even be

487
00:23:45,710 --> 00:23:49,069
spending that not least a group called

488
00:23:47,420 --> 00:23:50,900
the Merseyside skeptics and we'll hear

489
00:23:49,069 --> 00:23:53,389
from Mike Marshall from them in a moment

490
00:23:50,900 --> 00:23:54,920
but first dr. Hugh Nielsen now he's a GP

491
00:23:53,390 --> 00:23:56,509
in Liverpool and as well as using

492
00:23:54,920 --> 00:23:58,700
conventional medicine he practices

493
00:23:56,509 --> 00:24:00,680
homeopathy one day a week at a clinic in

494
00:23:58,700 --> 00:24:02,930
old swamp he told me this room for both

495
00:24:00,680 --> 00:24:04,789
in the NHS yeah I use both you know most

496
00:24:02,930 --> 00:24:07,580
of my professional life is spent using

497
00:24:04,789 --> 00:24:09,680
conventional medicine probably eight

498
00:24:07,579 --> 00:24:11,990
eighty percent most of the time four

499
00:24:09,680 --> 00:24:13,880

days a week am a GP and the one day a

500

00:24:11,990 --> 00:24:16,819

week on a monday i practice homeopathy

501

00:24:13,880 --> 00:24:20,720

and I practice a bit of homeopathy in my

502

00:24:16,819 --> 00:24:22,399

normal everyday GP work and can I ask

503

00:24:20,720 --> 00:24:25,370

you why you believe homeopathy has a

504

00:24:22,400 --> 00:24:27,890

place in the NHS well because I think

505

00:24:25,369 --> 00:24:29,059

it's been around for 200 years and I

506

00:24:27,890 --> 00:24:30,790

think there's a reasonable amount of

507

00:24:29,059 --> 00:24:34,009

evidence that shows that it works and

508

00:24:30,789 --> 00:24:36,079

it's in my experience for certain

509

00:24:34,009 --> 00:24:37,759

conditions which works very well it's

510

00:24:36,079 --> 00:24:39,980

very safe and it's got very few side

511

00:24:37,759 --> 00:24:41,539

effects and it can be very effective the

512

00:24:39,980 --> 00:24:43,490

big controversy is that we don't know

513

00:24:41,539 --> 00:24:45,170

how it works and some of the remedies

514
00:24:43,490 --> 00:24:47,450
that we use are so diluted

515
00:24:45,170 --> 00:24:49,370
there is no none of the original

516
00:24:47,450 --> 00:24:51,830
substance present yes I was just water

517
00:24:49,369 --> 00:24:54,169
is it it's just water in the chemical

518
00:24:51,829 --> 00:24:55,849
sense but it's not just water in the

519
00:24:54,170 --> 00:24:58,279
physical sense I mean there have been a

520
00:24:55,849 --> 00:25:00,799
few quite a few studies looking at the

521
00:24:58,279 --> 00:25:02,569
properties of these ultra dilute

522
00:25:00,799 --> 00:25:04,129
solutions that we call them and they

523
00:25:02,569 --> 00:25:06,259
appear to they have different physical

524
00:25:04,130 --> 00:25:07,520
properties from pure water but it's

525
00:25:06,259 --> 00:25:09,319
chemically the same as Walt I mean

526
00:25:07,519 --> 00:25:11,269
what's the difference between a chemical

527
00:25:09,319 --> 00:25:13,369
analysis and as you're saying a physical

528
00:25:11,269 --> 00:25:15,920
analysis surely the chemistry is the

529
00:25:13,369 --> 00:25:17,779
physical is it no the chemistry is the

530
00:25:15,920 --> 00:25:19,970
actual molecules that are there or are

531
00:25:17,779 --> 00:25:21,710
not there the visit the physical things

532
00:25:19,970 --> 00:25:24,680
as the actual properties there is some

533
00:25:21,710 --> 00:25:28,220
sort of energy in this remedy right

534
00:25:24,680 --> 00:25:30,590
those has an effect on cells and on

535
00:25:28,220 --> 00:25:31,910
human bodies and an animal's when you

536
00:25:30,589 --> 00:25:33,139
talk about energy there that's the kind

537
00:25:31,910 --> 00:25:35,150
of thing that people who maybe practice

538
00:25:33,140 --> 00:25:38,630
Reiki say isn't it I mean you might as

539
00:25:35,150 --> 00:25:40,040
well lay on hands in that sense no it's

540
00:25:38,630 --> 00:25:41,510
a different and it's a completely

541
00:25:40,039 --> 00:25:43,639
different system from Reiki I don't know

542

00:25:41,509 --> 00:25:46,069
much about Reiki r21 I just but they

543
00:25:43,640 --> 00:25:48,890
talk about energy don't they yes they do

544
00:25:46,069 --> 00:25:52,220
talk about energy but the you know it I

545
00:25:48,890 --> 00:25:53,660
can't explain how it works you know but

546
00:25:52,220 --> 00:25:55,309
I'm just saying that there is evidence

547
00:25:53,660 --> 00:25:57,380
that these ultra dilute solutions have

548
00:25:55,309 --> 00:25:59,359
some sort of effect isn't it just blew

549
00:25:57,380 --> 00:26:01,400
see back then if there isn't any medical

550
00:25:59,359 --> 00:26:02,809
or chemistry involved isn't it just

551
00:26:01,400 --> 00:26:04,730
placebo and I'm not saying that that's

552
00:26:02,809 --> 00:26:06,529
not effective because placebo is very

553
00:26:04,730 --> 00:26:08,930
powerful sometimes but you might as well

554
00:26:06,529 --> 00:26:11,230
give them a sugar pill well I mean

555
00:26:08,930 --> 00:26:13,549
there's been over a hundred trials in

556
00:26:11,230 --> 00:26:16,400

homeopathy have been lots of trials and

557

00:26:13,549 --> 00:26:18,859

the the balance shows that it is more

558

00:26:16,400 --> 00:26:20,960

than placebo and do you think that I

559

00:26:18,859 --> 00:26:23,479

mean you you devote one day of Europe

560

00:26:20,960 --> 00:26:25,460

your NHS work or one day of your working

561

00:26:23,480 --> 00:26:26,930

week to this clearly that's a day when

562

00:26:25,460 --> 00:26:28,549

perhaps you could be applying

563

00:26:26,930 --> 00:26:31,970

conventional medicine on the NHS to

564

00:26:28,549 --> 00:26:33,740

people I could but there's over 250

565

00:26:31,970 --> 00:26:36,380

excellent GPS in Liverpool doing that

566

00:26:33,740 --> 00:26:39,079

and there's only me practicing

567

00:26:36,380 --> 00:26:40,970

homeopathy and as I said I see people

568

00:26:39,079 --> 00:26:42,289

that have tried conveying everything in

569

00:26:40,970 --> 00:26:44,509

conventional medicine and it hasn't

570

00:26:42,289 --> 00:26:46,609

worked right so I think from that point

571
00:26:44,509 --> 00:26:48,829
of view it's a valuable service you know

572
00:26:46,609 --> 00:26:50,419
and I'm not one might argue well you

573
00:26:48,829 --> 00:26:51,859
know the conventional medicine that

574
00:26:50,420 --> 00:26:54,170
they've got isn't up to scratch that is

575
00:26:51,859 --> 00:26:55,879
not the case you know the GPS in

576
00:26:54,170 --> 00:26:56,730
Liverpool and world are on the whole

577
00:26:55,880 --> 00:26:58,919
excellent

578
00:26:56,730 --> 00:27:00,329
and they're not sending me patience but

579
00:26:58,919 --> 00:27:01,710
they've missed something they have they

580
00:27:00,329 --> 00:27:03,089
haven't diagnosed something that I

581
00:27:01,710 --> 00:27:04,890
haven't tried the right treatment yeah

582
00:27:03,089 --> 00:27:07,649
believe me every single patient that I

583
00:27:04,890 --> 00:27:10,590
see in either st. Catharines or Old Swan

584
00:27:07,650 --> 00:27:12,169
has had the an excellent work up from

585
00:27:10,589 --> 00:27:14,759
the conventional point of view and

586
00:27:12,169 --> 00:27:16,650
sometimes it just doesn't work so that

587
00:27:14,759 --> 00:27:17,759
that's where I think homeopathy comes in

588
00:27:16,650 --> 00:27:19,290
and in a way you've preempted my next

589
00:27:17,759 --> 00:27:21,179
question which was that the NHS spends

590
00:27:19,289 --> 00:27:23,519
four million quid a year on homeopathy

591
00:27:21,179 --> 00:27:25,679
and there are those who say that you

592
00:27:23,519 --> 00:27:27,000
know when nicer withholding expensive

593
00:27:25,679 --> 00:27:28,710
treatments for cancer that do work

594
00:27:27,000 --> 00:27:30,000
because of financial restrictions we

595
00:27:28,710 --> 00:27:32,490
shouldn't be spending a penny on this

596
00:27:30,000 --> 00:27:34,650
stuff well I would disagree that Eric

597
00:27:32,490 --> 00:27:36,539
doesn't work and you know four million

598
00:27:34,650 --> 00:27:39,269
and in addition that's the whole of the

599

00:27:36,539 --> 00:27:43,048
NHS in the UK Liverpool spends

600
00:27:39,269 --> 00:27:44,970
twenty-nine thousand pounds a year which

601
00:27:43,048 --> 00:27:47,220
is point zero zero four percent of their

602
00:27:44,970 --> 00:27:49,798
budget it's a drop in the ocean you know

603
00:27:47,220 --> 00:27:51,179
it is a tiny amount and the NHS drug

604
00:27:49,798 --> 00:27:52,379
budgets I don't know what it is but it's

605
00:27:51,179 --> 00:27:54,269
a hell of a lot more than four million

606
00:27:52,380 --> 00:27:57,540
you know attaching a teacher you might

607
00:27:54,269 --> 00:27:59,879
call it yes old for dilute amount yes

608
00:27:57,539 --> 00:28:02,190
okay and I think we provide a valuable

609
00:27:59,880 --> 00:28:04,140
service and yes you know there is always

610
00:28:02,190 --> 00:28:07,080
going to be shortages for cancer

611
00:28:04,140 --> 00:28:08,940
treatment but we are looking at people

612
00:28:07,079 --> 00:28:11,399
who are tried everything conventional

613
00:28:08,940 --> 00:28:13,440

medicine and this is a safe and very

614

00:28:11,400 --> 00:28:15,150
very cheap and can be effective

615

00:28:13,440 --> 00:28:16,980
treatment for this group of people

616

00:28:15,150 --> 00:28:18,600
really interesting you thanks a lot for

617

00:28:16,980 --> 00:28:21,539
talking on the show today preacher very

618

00:28:18,599 --> 00:28:23,939
oprah's retailers dr. hugh nielsen let's

619

00:28:21,539 --> 00:28:27,149
also speak to mike marshall here is from

620

00:28:23,940 --> 00:28:28,590
the Merseyside skeptics society and they

621

00:28:27,150 --> 00:28:31,200
have their doubts about this hello to

622

00:28:28,589 --> 00:28:33,720
you Mike hi hi just listening as you

623

00:28:31,200 --> 00:28:35,730
were there if people want this stuff why

624

00:28:33,720 --> 00:28:38,160
shouldn't the NHS pay for it well the

625

00:28:35,730 --> 00:28:39,779
simple fact is it doesn't work it's very

626

00:28:38,160 --> 00:28:40,860
easy to say that there are studies here

627

00:28:39,779 --> 00:28:42,418
there are studies there but actually

628
00:28:40,859 --> 00:28:44,069
when you look at the quality of the

629
00:28:42,419 --> 00:28:45,600
studies the best quality studies showed

630
00:28:44,069 --> 00:28:48,389
there is absolutely no effect in the

631
00:28:45,599 --> 00:28:49,798
homeopathy and this is a case that there

632
00:28:48,390 --> 00:28:51,000
might be one or two doctors here and

633
00:28:49,798 --> 00:28:53,190
there might suggest that it does work

634
00:28:51,000 --> 00:28:55,048
but the overwhelming majority of doctors

635
00:28:53,190 --> 00:28:57,840
say it will fade to the work in a one in

636
00:28:55,048 --> 00:28:59,369
a thousand might say it works 999 would

637
00:28:57,839 --> 00:29:01,829
completely disagree in medical

638
00:28:59,369 --> 00:29:03,149
establishment the consensus absolutely

639
00:29:01,829 --> 00:29:06,298
is clear at this point that homeopathy

640
00:29:03,150 --> 00:29:09,179
is nothing ineffective sugar pills for

641
00:29:06,298 --> 00:29:09,960
siebel pills you might say the very best

642
00:29:09,179 --> 00:29:12,000
most credible

643
00:29:09,960 --> 00:29:13,350
expert body's completely agrees British

644
00:29:12,000 --> 00:29:15,450
Medical Association the royal

645
00:29:13,349 --> 00:29:17,028
pharmaceutical society the House of

646
00:29:15,450 --> 00:29:19,230
Commons signed Technology Committee

647
00:29:17,028 --> 00:29:21,089
every single one of these bodies have

648
00:29:19,230 --> 00:29:23,339
looked at the evidence said this doesn't

649
00:29:21,089 --> 00:29:24,689
work we shouldn't be wasting 45 million

650
00:29:23,339 --> 00:29:26,009
pounds ago on this well if it's that

651
00:29:24,690 --> 00:29:27,538
money could go to pee if it's appeared

652
00:29:26,009 --> 00:29:29,038
in scientific journals that have been

653
00:29:27,538 --> 00:29:30,950
peer-reviewed then it must be some

654
00:29:29,038 --> 00:29:33,990
backing to it when you look at the

655
00:29:30,950 --> 00:29:36,090
studies that that suggests that it works

656

00:29:33,990 --> 00:29:38,429
i mean i think dr. tanius inside of one

657
00:29:36,089 --> 00:29:41,158
from 2014 the actual conclusions of

658
00:29:38,429 --> 00:29:42,690
study he's citing said this doesn't show

659
00:29:41,159 --> 00:29:44,820
that there's a very strong effect it

660
00:29:42,690 --> 00:29:46,140
says we need to examine this more

661
00:29:44,819 --> 00:29:48,778
evidence is needed because this isn't

662
00:29:46,140 --> 00:29:50,788
conclusive the very best studies the

663
00:29:48,778 --> 00:29:52,470
ones that are though with double-blind

664
00:29:50,788 --> 00:29:55,230
they don't tell anybody whether they're

665
00:29:52,470 --> 00:29:56,788
getting the homeopathy with feeble those

666
00:29:55,230 --> 00:29:59,069
are the studies that show no effect at

667
00:29:56,788 --> 00:30:00,690
all once you start removing the blinding

668
00:29:59,069 --> 00:30:02,759
and doing studies I don't have quite as

669
00:30:00,690 --> 00:30:04,798
many people in aren't quite as well

670
00:30:02,759 --> 00:30:06,450

conducted you start to see artifacts

671

00:30:04,798 --> 00:30:07,918

appearing as if this works but that's

672

00:30:06,450 --> 00:30:10,350

why we do studies in the best way

673

00:30:07,919 --> 00:30:11,880

possible but simply isn't ever and any

674

00:30:10,349 --> 00:30:14,099

evidence right now that this works at

675

00:30:11,880 --> 00:30:15,750

all but what about those who say well it

676

00:30:14,099 --> 00:30:17,778

worked for me and there will be those

677

00:30:15,750 --> 00:30:20,849

who say that I mean not everybody has

678

00:30:17,778 --> 00:30:22,200

absolute faith in science or at least

679

00:30:20,849 --> 00:30:23,730

they believe that there might be other

680

00:30:22,200 --> 00:30:25,259

things than science that might be at

681

00:30:23,730 --> 00:30:27,149

play and we don't know everything and we

682

00:30:25,259 --> 00:30:28,319

can't we can't claim to can we well

683

00:30:27,148 --> 00:30:30,269

absolutely we don't know everything but

684

00:30:28,319 --> 00:30:32,220

the best where we have of finding things

685
00:30:30,269 --> 00:30:33,960
out is by doing a proper study on it I

686
00:30:32,220 --> 00:30:35,759
mean they can have an individual person

687
00:30:33,960 --> 00:30:37,950
will really feel that it worked for them

688
00:30:35,759 --> 00:30:39,329
but how do they know that they weren't

689
00:30:37,950 --> 00:30:40,380
going to get better anyway or that it

690
00:30:39,329 --> 00:30:41,908
wasn't something else that they were

691
00:30:40,380 --> 00:30:43,350
doing and that's really what a study is

692
00:30:41,909 --> 00:30:45,778
that's really what science is it's not

693
00:30:43,349 --> 00:30:47,849
something magical it's not something

694
00:30:45,778 --> 00:30:49,528
where that scientists get in a room and

695
00:30:47,849 --> 00:30:51,240
decide what's true it's just our way of

696
00:30:49,528 --> 00:30:53,190
finding out right what is true and what

697
00:30:51,240 --> 00:30:55,528
isn't but that you know he said there

698
00:30:53,190 --> 00:30:58,230
didn't see that he mainly practices this

699
00:30:55,528 --> 00:31:00,148
where the science and the conventional

700
00:30:58,230 --> 00:31:01,798
medicine has failed so it's not like you

701
00:31:00,148 --> 00:31:03,359
would be going this is wouldn't be

702
00:31:01,798 --> 00:31:04,558
first-line treatment with it this would

703
00:31:03,359 --> 00:31:06,629
be something you try after conventional

704
00:31:04,558 --> 00:31:08,099
medicine have failed and maybe it was

705
00:31:06,630 --> 00:31:10,649
the last chance saloon just might work

706
00:31:08,099 --> 00:31:12,119
it's worth a try isn't it well it's very

707
00:31:10,648 --> 00:31:13,349
easy to say that but unfortunately I

708
00:31:12,119 --> 00:31:15,538
said this is money that's coming out of

709
00:31:13,349 --> 00:31:17,668
the public purse it's five million

710
00:31:15,538 --> 00:31:19,470
pounds ago and it's very easy so there's

711
00:31:17,669 --> 00:31:21,028
a very small amount of money from the

712
00:31:19,470 --> 00:31:22,950
NHS naught point naught naught four

713

00:31:21,028 --> 00:31:23,490
percent but I mean I don't want to be

714
00:31:22,950 --> 00:31:26,340
the one who

715
00:31:23,490 --> 00:31:28,200
looks at somebody who has had their

716
00:31:26,339 --> 00:31:29,819
their treatment denied because of

717
00:31:28,200 --> 00:31:31,380
funding reasons and say well it's okay

718
00:31:29,819 --> 00:31:32,399
we're only wasting a small amount I mean

719
00:31:31,380 --> 00:31:34,200
yes this could have funded your

720
00:31:32,400 --> 00:31:36,720
treatment instead we're spending on

721
00:31:34,200 --> 00:31:39,058
things we know at this point do not work

722
00:31:36,720 --> 00:31:40,710
I think any amount of money spent on

723
00:31:39,058 --> 00:31:42,660
treatments that can be sure not to work

724
00:31:40,710 --> 00:31:44,069
should be something we should be very

725
00:31:42,660 --> 00:31:45,090
concerned about so we should spend that

726
00:31:44,069 --> 00:31:56,849
money in places where they can

727
00:31:45,089 --> 00:31:59,839

legitimately help people on Manor calm

728

00:31:56,849 --> 00:31:59,839

Donna you it's

729

00:32:02,490 --> 00:32:10,620

episode 21 with Tim Ferguson

730

00:32:07,119 --> 00:32:10,619

I know

731

00:32:14,259 --> 00:32:18,670

ring the bell do the thing Tim

732

00:32:16,509 --> 00:32:19,930

Ferguson's write a reply to something

733

00:32:18,670 --> 00:32:24,009

that Nam on the know and asked in the

734

00:32:19,930 --> 00:32:26,140

first place don't expect what are you

735

00:32:24,009 --> 00:32:29,230

wondering what do I think it's very

736

00:32:26,140 --> 00:32:31,450

simple you've got to engage with the

737

00:32:29,230 --> 00:32:35,230

Murdoch press if you're not sure about

738

00:32:31,450 --> 00:32:38,289

your political stance read any opinion

739

00:32:35,230 --> 00:32:40,599

page in any of the Murdoch periodicals

740

00:32:38,289 --> 00:32:43,180

Miranda devons that one marrano divine

741

00:32:40,599 --> 00:32:44,949

she's always of interest anything in the

742
00:32:43,180 --> 00:32:48,220
australian janet all bricks in a very

743
00:32:44,950 --> 00:32:50,620
cogent writer and also Henry Ergas who's

744
00:32:48,220 --> 00:32:52,630
writtens on these vets that's so funny

745
00:32:50,619 --> 00:32:54,669
this morning but you've got to have a

746
00:32:52,630 --> 00:32:58,030
look at this stuff you have to watch fox

747
00:32:54,670 --> 00:32:59,920
news you have to embrace this stuff

748
00:32:58,029 --> 00:33:02,200
because where's this going to get us if

749
00:32:59,920 --> 00:33:04,720
we do this well then you will know that

750
00:33:02,200 --> 00:33:06,850
whatever they're saying you don't agree

751
00:33:04,720 --> 00:33:09,039
with because you are rational your

752
00:33:06,849 --> 00:33:11,679
artistic your creative your thoughtful

753
00:33:09,039 --> 00:33:14,529
you care about other people so if you're

754
00:33:11,680 --> 00:33:18,190
not at all sure what you truly believe

755
00:33:14,529 --> 00:33:20,980
tune into Murdoch newscom has the

756
00:33:18,190 --> 00:33:23,380
opposite of what you are that's Tim

757
00:33:20,980 --> 00:33:26,920
Ferguson's write a reply straight from

758
00:33:23,380 --> 00:33:39,570
the mouth bunga bunga or as we like to

759
00:33:26,920 --> 00:33:39,570
say on Maynard condone are you hey you

760
00:33:45,700 --> 00:33:54,039
what we want is some more evidence

761
00:33:48,289 --> 00:33:54,039
please is Joe alabaster

762
00:33:55,589 --> 00:33:59,928
hello this is Joe alabaster

763
00:34:02,038 --> 00:34:11,829
posted februari 18th 2016 on ABC net au

764
00:34:08,429 --> 00:34:16,210
low vaccination rates caused by parental

765
00:34:11,829 --> 00:34:18,490
suspicion says researcher a researcher

766
00:34:16,210 --> 00:34:21,338
from the university of sydney says

767
00:34:18,489 --> 00:34:23,618
suspicion rather than neglect is behind

768
00:34:21,338 --> 00:34:27,369
low vaccination rates on the new south

769
00:34:23,619 --> 00:34:29,139
wales north coast a recent National

770

00:34:27,369 --> 00:34:32,050
Health performance Authority report

771
00:34:29,139 --> 00:34:33,760
showed less than forty seven percent of

772
00:34:32,050 --> 00:34:35,560
five-year-olds living in the Mollom

773
00:34:33,760 --> 00:34:39,069
Bimby area of the Shire were fully

774
00:34:35,559 --> 00:34:41,500
immunized the rate was fifty percent for

775
00:34:39,068 --> 00:34:43,690
two-year-olds and less than fifty four

776
00:34:41,500 --> 00:34:46,898
percent for one year old children in the

777
00:34:43,690 --> 00:34:49,358
postcode the Australian chief medical

778
00:34:46,898 --> 00:34:51,848
officer and all state and territory

779
00:34:49,358 --> 00:34:54,338
chief health officers agreed to a target

780
00:34:51,849 --> 00:34:59,050
of ninety-five percent of children to be

781
00:34:54,338 --> 00:35:01,358
fully immunized PhD candidate Katherine

782
00:34:59,050 --> 00:35:03,640
helps has interviewed parents in the

783
00:35:01,358 --> 00:35:06,489
Byron Shire who refused to immunize

784
00:35:03,639 --> 00:35:08,769

their children ms help said the

785

00:35:06,489 --> 00:35:11,068

situation in Byron was the result of a

786

00:35:08,769 --> 00:35:14,230

conscious decision making by parents

787

00:35:11,068 --> 00:35:15,940

quote they're very vigilant around the

788

00:35:14,230 --> 00:35:19,329

well-being of their children and what

789

00:35:15,940 --> 00:35:21,940

goes into them end quote she said quote

790

00:35:19,329 --> 00:35:24,250

when they look at a product like some of

791

00:35:21,940 --> 00:35:26,289

the vaccinations they have concerns

792

00:35:24,250 --> 00:35:28,659

about the product and they also have

793

00:35:26,289 --> 00:35:30,159

concerns about the transparency and the

794

00:35:28,659 --> 00:35:32,139

motivation of the people who are

795

00:35:30,159 --> 00:35:34,539

encouraging them very strongly to have

796

00:35:32,139 --> 00:35:36,519

that done they're not sure that the

797

00:35:34,539 --> 00:35:39,309

motivation necessarily comes from the

798

00:35:36,519 --> 00:35:41,530

best intentions for their child there is

799

00:35:39,309 --> 00:35:45,699

some concern about there being profit

800

00:35:41,530 --> 00:35:47,920

motive and quote health authorities have

801

00:35:45,699 --> 00:35:49,809

warned that low vaccination rates could

802

00:35:47,920 --> 00:35:51,789

leave the region ripe for an outbreak of

803

00:35:49,809 --> 00:35:55,299

diseases which have largely been

804

00:35:51,789 --> 00:35:57,130

eradicated in Australia dr. Vickie

805

00:35:55,300 --> 00:35:59,318

Shepherd from New South Wales health

806

00:35:57,130 --> 00:36:01,599

said the deadly respiratory disease

807

00:35:59,318 --> 00:36:03,940

diphtheria was still common in parts of

808

00:36:01,599 --> 00:36:05,890

Asia and the Pacific she said people

809

00:36:03,940 --> 00:36:07,929

entering Australia from those areas

810

00:36:05,889 --> 00:36:11,469

could carry the bacteria in on their

811

00:36:07,929 --> 00:36:13,480

skin quote it's probably only about five

812

00:36:11,469 --> 00:36:14,859

years ago that happened in Queensland

813
00:36:13,480 --> 00:36:17,409
when someone brought the

814
00:36:14,860 --> 00:36:20,019
bug back from overseas and quote dr.

815
00:36:17,409 --> 00:36:21,639
Shepherd said quote they weren't

816
00:36:20,019 --> 00:36:24,250
affected themselves because they were

817
00:36:21,639 --> 00:36:25,989
vaccinated but they were in contact with

818
00:36:24,250 --> 00:36:28,000
a young adult who had never been

819
00:36:25,989 --> 00:36:33,039
vaccinated and she died from diphtheria

820
00:36:28,000 --> 00:36:34,690
and quote last year the federal

821
00:36:33,039 --> 00:36:36,849
government announced that some welfare

822
00:36:34,690 --> 00:36:39,059
benefits would be denied people who

823
00:36:36,849 --> 00:36:42,339
refuse to immunize their children

824
00:36:39,059 --> 00:36:43,690
mullumbimby mother Heidi Robertson who

825
00:36:42,340 --> 00:36:46,450
helped to form the Northern Rivers

826
00:36:43,690 --> 00:36:48,700
vaccination supporters group in 2013

827

00:36:46,449 --> 00:36:52,210
said she was hopeful the policy would

828
00:36:48,699 --> 00:36:54,129
eventually pay dividends quote we can

829
00:36:52,210 --> 00:36:56,559
only go on anecdotes that we've got from

830
00:36:54,130 --> 00:36:58,269
local immunization providers and there

831
00:36:56,559 --> 00:37:00,130
are lots and lots of phone calls coming

832
00:36:58,269 --> 00:37:02,380
in from parents finding out more

833
00:37:00,130 --> 00:37:04,809
information about the vaccinations and

834
00:37:02,380 --> 00:37:07,480
placing their kids on to these catch up

835
00:37:04,809 --> 00:37:11,139
schedules and quote she said quote

836
00:37:07,480 --> 00:37:12,940
that's very promising and quote miss

837
00:37:11,139 --> 00:37:14,739
Robertson said friends of hers from

838
00:37:12,940 --> 00:37:16,659
other parts of Australia were reluctant

839
00:37:14,739 --> 00:37:20,709
to visit the region which relies heavily

840
00:37:16,659 --> 00:37:22,629
on tourism quote they're absolutely

841
00:37:20,710 --> 00:37:25,119

astounded that less than one in two

842

00:37:22,630 --> 00:37:27,490

children are fully vaccinated here they

843

00:37:25,119 --> 00:37:30,250

don't understand it and quote she said

844

00:37:27,489 --> 00:37:31,750

quote in fact many of them say they

845

00:37:30,250 --> 00:37:33,730

wouldn't come for a holiday in this

846

00:37:31,750 --> 00:37:38,050

region because of that fact alone and

847

00:37:33,730 --> 00:37:40,780

quote the New South Wales opposition's

848

00:37:38,050 --> 00:37:42,460

health spokesman Walt's accord said the

849

00:37:40,780 --> 00:37:44,650

vaccination rates recorded around

850

00:37:42,460 --> 00:37:48,190

mullumbimby were usually associated with

851

00:37:44,650 --> 00:37:49,840

developing nations quote now that is

852

00:37:48,190 --> 00:37:53,289

irresponsible in a country like

853

00:37:49,840 --> 00:37:55,240

Australia and quote he said quote people

854

00:37:53,289 --> 00:37:57,250

in Africa line up to vaccinate their

855

00:37:55,239 --> 00:37:59,559

children but on the north coast of New

856
00:37:57,250 --> 00:38:01,469
South Wales people are not doing it and

857
00:37:59,559 --> 00:38:03,659
quote

858
00:38:01,469 --> 00:38:06,089
the New South Wales Health Minister

859
00:38:03,659 --> 00:38:08,779
Jillian Skinner has so far declined to

860
00:38:06,090 --> 00:38:08,780
comment on the issue

861
00:38:19,619 --> 00:38:25,079
hi this is Heidi Robertson from the

862
00:38:23,139 --> 00:38:27,960
Northern Rivers vaccination supporters

863
00:38:25,079 --> 00:38:30,579
we are a group of concerned citizens

864
00:38:27,960 --> 00:38:33,159
dedicated to promoting good science and

865
00:38:30,579 --> 00:38:36,278
common sense in our region the far north

866
00:38:33,159 --> 00:38:37,989
coast of New South Wales this area of

867
00:38:36,278 --> 00:38:41,018
famous for its natural beauty and

868
00:38:37,989 --> 00:38:44,618
relaxed lifestyle also has the lowest

869
00:38:41,018 --> 00:38:46,719
rates of vaccination in Australia we are

870
00:38:44,619 --> 00:38:49,150
out to change that by challenging the

871
00:38:46,719 --> 00:38:50,828
myths and misinformation and by

872
00:38:49,150 --> 00:38:54,130
providing good evidence based

873
00:38:50,829 --> 00:38:55,990
information to the community we'd love

874
00:38:54,130 --> 00:38:59,619
for you no matter where you are in the

875
00:38:55,989 --> 00:39:07,209
world to join our fight please visit our

876
00:38:59,619 --> 00:39:10,028
webpage at ww nrvs info we also have a

877
00:39:07,210 --> 00:39:14,349
link there to our facebook page tweet us

878
00:39:10,028 --> 00:39:16,960
at in our faqs supporters that's vix and

879
00:39:14,349 --> 00:39:19,599
check us out on Wikipedia by searching

880
00:39:16,960 --> 00:39:23,338
for Northern Rivers vaccination

881
00:39:19,599 --> 00:39:23,338
supporters thank you

882
00:39:30,230 --> 00:39:32,260
Oh

883
00:39:36,338 --> 00:39:41,920
thank you for listening to the skeptic

884

00:39:38,960 --> 00:39:44,420
zone and thank you to jay alabaster and

885
00:39:41,920 --> 00:39:46,849
Michael Marshall and everybody else who

886
00:39:44,420 --> 00:39:48,500
helped me put this episode together I

887
00:39:46,849 --> 00:39:52,220
think we're going to have to investigate

888
00:39:48,500 --> 00:39:55,849
this science channel from the Royal

889
00:39:52,219 --> 00:39:57,828
Institution of Australia a bit more but

890
00:39:55,849 --> 00:39:59,720
before I go a big thank you to those

891
00:39:57,829 --> 00:40:02,450
people who are helping the skeptics

892
00:39:59,719 --> 00:40:04,939
owned by buying merchandise from mr.

893
00:40:02,449 --> 00:40:08,088
Katz origami jewelry there's a link at

894
00:40:04,940 --> 00:40:12,679
skeptic zone TV all those proceeds help

895
00:40:08,088 --> 00:40:15,230
keep the skeptic zone on air but for

896
00:40:12,679 --> 00:40:17,149
this week from a secret location which

897
00:40:15,230 --> 00:40:23,900
is a little bit echoing I must say this

898
00:40:17,150 --> 00:40:25,519

is Richard Saunders signing off you've

899

00:40:23,900 --> 00:40:29,088

been listening to the skeptics own

900

00:40:25,519 --> 00:40:32,000

podcast visit our website at wwc a

901

00:40:29,088 --> 00:40:35,449

petting zoo TV for contacts and archive

902

00:40:32,000 --> 00:40:38,150

of all episodes since 2008 and our

903

00:40:35,449 --> 00:40:40,058

online store please support the skeptic

904

00:40:38,150 --> 00:40:43,220

zone by following us on twitter at

905

00:40:40,059 --> 00:40:46,849

skeptic zone liking us on facebook and

906

00:40:43,219 --> 00:40:49,039

leaving a review on iTunes you can also

907

00:40:46,849 --> 00:40:52,210

show your support by subscribing via

908

00:40:49,039 --> 00:40:54,980

paypal for as little as 99 cents a week

909

00:40:52,210 --> 00:40:56,599

the skeptic zone is an independent

910

00:40:54,980 --> 00:40:59,059

production the views and opinions

911

00:40:56,599 --> 00:41:00,680

expressed on the skeptic zone and not

912

00:40:59,059 --> 00:41:03,559

necessarily those of Australian

913

00:41:00,679 --> 00:41:06,338

skeptical or any other skeptical

914

00:41:03,559 --> 00:41:06,339

organization

915

00:41:06,849 --> 00:41:08,880

Oh