

1  
00:00:00,000 --> 00:00:05,040  
lets you know that our first speaker is

2  
00:00:02,609 --> 00:00:07,169  
Paul Smith he's an alumnus of seven

3  
00:00:05,040 --> 00:00:10,019  
years in the military Stargate remote

4  
00:00:07,169 --> 00:00:12,349  
viewing program he's author of reading

5  
00:00:10,019 --> 00:00:15,359  
the enemy's mind inside Stargate

6  
00:00:12,349 --> 00:00:17,009  
America's psychic experience among other

7  
00:00:15,359 --> 00:00:19,439  
things he's the president and chief

8  
00:00:17,010 --> 00:00:22,109  
instructor of the for-profit remote

9  
00:00:19,439 --> 00:00:24,629  
viewing instructional services and is

10  
00:00:22,109 --> 00:00:27,420  
also this year's president of the

11  
00:00:24,629 --> 00:00:32,149  
nonprofit international remote viewing

12  
00:00:27,420 --> 00:00:38,090  
Association so Paul Smith yeah he's here

13  
00:00:32,149 --> 00:00:38,090  
he's coming up there get hooked

14  
00:00:50,369 --> 00:00:55,449  
okay can you hear me much your

15  
00:00:53,590 --> 00:00:58,210  
misfortune you can right all right

16  
00:00:55,450 --> 00:01:00,550  
remote control here okay word backwards

17  
00:00:58,210 --> 00:01:02,170  
laser pointer laser pointer that's this

18  
00:01:00,549 --> 00:01:08,469  
guy this red thing apparently okay

19  
00:01:02,170 --> 00:01:11,019  
excellent okay he'll give me five

20  
00:01:08,469 --> 00:01:15,549  
minutes three minute one minute warning

21  
00:01:11,019 --> 00:01:18,909  
exists I'm afraid of warnings okay why

22  
00:01:15,549 --> 00:01:20,409  
sigh is consciousnesses only hope I've

23  
00:01:18,909 --> 00:01:22,269  
changes title a little bit from what it

24  
00:01:20,409 --> 00:01:25,118  
says in your program both in light of

25  
00:01:22,269 --> 00:01:27,039  
the talk I'm responding to and further

26  
00:01:25,118 --> 00:01:29,649  
thoughts on exactly what the point was I

27  
00:01:27,039 --> 00:01:31,359  
was trying to make and the talk i'm

28  
00:01:29,649 --> 00:01:34,329  
responding to let's see if I can figure

29

00:01:31,359 --> 00:01:37,689  
this out yes was given by Susan

30  
00:01:34,329 --> 00:01:38,978  
Blackmore back in 1996 her title was why

31  
00:01:37,689 --> 00:01:42,009  
sigh tells us nothing about

32  
00:01:38,978 --> 00:01:43,868  
consciousness now I pick on Susan even

33  
00:01:42,009 --> 00:01:46,209  
though this is what 12 years after the

34  
00:01:43,868 --> 00:01:49,989  
fact for a couple reasons first of all

35  
00:01:46,209 --> 00:01:52,750  
her perspective mirrors pretty much that

36  
00:01:49,989 --> 00:01:55,750  
about about consciousness the the same

37  
00:01:52,750 --> 00:01:58,560  
perspective this kind of events in the

38  
00:01:55,750 --> 00:02:02,709  
psychology and the philosophy of

39  
00:01:58,560 --> 00:02:04,269  
disciplines in general okay our concept

40  
00:02:02,709 --> 00:02:06,279  
is we'll see is a little bit broader

41  
00:02:04,269 --> 00:02:08,109  
than that but but she's got a pretty

42  
00:02:06,280 --> 00:02:10,118  
pretty straightforward academic view of

43  
00:02:08,110 --> 00:02:13,870

consciousness and she's really the only

44

00:02:10,118 --> 00:02:16,509

one that's addressed this issue of sigh

45

00:02:13,870 --> 00:02:22,000

in relation to consciousness in a kind

46

00:02:16,509 --> 00:02:24,370

of a skeptical way her argument goes

47

00:02:22,000 --> 00:02:27,400

something like this first of all ESP is

48

00:02:24,370 --> 00:02:29,379

probably non-existent she doesn't come

49

00:02:27,400 --> 00:02:32,610

right out and declare it non-existent

50

00:02:29,379 --> 00:02:35,650

she started off life as a

51

00:02:32,610 --> 00:02:37,329

parapsychologist very much disposed to

52

00:02:35,650 --> 00:02:39,010

believing in it and then over a series

53

00:02:37,329 --> 00:02:40,810

of disappointing experiments concluded

54

00:02:39,009 --> 00:02:43,209

that there probably wasn't anything to

55

00:02:40,810 --> 00:02:44,560

it but they weren't inconclusive enough

56

00:02:43,209 --> 00:02:48,849

that she was ready to reject the

57

00:02:44,560 --> 00:02:50,709

hypothesis altogether that ESP exists so

58  
00:02:48,849 --> 00:02:52,870  
I'm not going to say much more about

59  
00:02:50,709 --> 00:02:56,259  
that part of her argument that site

60  
00:02:52,870 --> 00:02:58,629  
doesn't exist that's a whole topic in

61  
00:02:56,259 --> 00:03:01,259  
itself and most of us are of the other

62  
00:02:58,629 --> 00:03:04,469  
mind based on evidence that we've seen

63  
00:03:01,259 --> 00:03:07,530  
okay one thing I do want to comment and

64  
00:03:04,469 --> 00:03:09,539  
I read her book and I found it very a

65  
00:03:07,530 --> 00:03:11,128  
very sincere effort to try and get to

66  
00:03:09,539 --> 00:03:14,519  
the bottom of what her experiences were

67  
00:03:11,128 --> 00:03:16,259  
but i think that throughout it has the

68  
00:03:14,519 --> 00:03:20,099  
demonstrates the failing that many

69  
00:03:16,259 --> 00:03:23,128  
people get interested in ESP fall into

70  
00:03:20,098 --> 00:03:24,719  
and that is to lay too much faith in a

71  
00:03:23,128 --> 00:03:26,939  
certain paradigm relate too much faith

72  
00:03:24,719 --> 00:03:30,389  
in a certain way of thinking about it

73  
00:03:26,939 --> 00:03:32,609  
and not being ready or able or willing

74  
00:03:30,389 --> 00:03:33,899  
to branch out and consider things from a

75  
00:03:32,609 --> 00:03:35,849  
different perspective questions one

76  
00:03:33,900 --> 00:03:38,219  
question ones assumptions think of a

77  
00:03:35,848 --> 00:03:39,358  
different way of approaching it she

78  
00:03:38,219 --> 00:03:40,919  
seems to have gotten kind of locked into

79  
00:03:39,359 --> 00:03:42,930  
a certain perspective and that happened

80  
00:03:40,919 --> 00:03:47,189  
to be a perspective that didn't work and

81  
00:03:42,930 --> 00:03:48,930  
hence or disappointment okay so second

82  
00:03:47,189 --> 00:03:50,519  
part of argument is that even if ESP

83  
00:03:48,930 --> 00:03:53,879  
does exist and this should have been psy

84  
00:03:50,519 --> 00:03:56,489  
every time you see ESP thinks I even if

85  
00:03:53,878 --> 00:04:00,018  
ESP or site does exist it gives no

86

00:03:56,489 --> 00:04:01,799  
evidence for consciousness and further

87  
00:04:00,019 --> 00:04:03,989  
neuroscience hasn't found any evidence

88  
00:04:01,799 --> 00:04:06,780  
of consciousness you they have found no

89  
00:04:03,989 --> 00:04:09,989  
location in the brain where where

90  
00:04:06,780 --> 00:04:13,139  
consciousness exists where consciousness

91  
00:04:09,989 --> 00:04:14,669  
is processed or whatever this is all

92  
00:04:13,139 --> 00:04:17,220  
more broadly known as the argument from

93  
00:04:14,669 --> 00:04:18,930  
physiology in the philosophy of mind the

94  
00:04:17,220 --> 00:04:20,930  
idea that science hasn't found anything

95  
00:04:18,930 --> 00:04:23,490  
that isn't physical in the brain and the

96  
00:04:20,930 --> 00:04:25,650  
conclusion is therefore we can safely

97  
00:04:23,490 --> 00:04:30,449  
presume that there is nothing that isn't

98  
00:04:25,649 --> 00:04:33,329  
physical in mental or or brain processes

99  
00:04:30,449 --> 00:04:35,160  
okay so this raises two questions that

100  
00:04:33,329 --> 00:04:37,649

we have to kind of address first what is

101

00:04:35,160 --> 00:04:39,840

consciousness and there are a couple of

102

00:04:37,649 --> 00:04:44,009

answers to this one is the easy answer

103

00:04:39,839 --> 00:04:47,638

nobody knows the true answer is

104

00:04:44,009 --> 00:04:49,759

everybody knows but you just can't

105

00:04:47,639 --> 00:04:51,930

describe it or explain it to anyone else

106

00:04:49,759 --> 00:04:53,969

consciousness is a very profoundly

107

00:04:51,930 --> 00:04:56,098

subjective experience and anytime you

108

00:04:53,970 --> 00:04:57,990

try and explain what your conscious

109

00:04:56,098 --> 00:04:59,610

experience is like to someone else you

110

00:04:57,990 --> 00:05:01,439

find yourself having to rely on words

111

00:04:59,610 --> 00:05:04,229

that you hope have the same meaning of

112

00:05:01,439 --> 00:05:06,360

the person you're talking to as opposed

113

00:05:04,228 --> 00:05:08,069

to maybe they have a whole different

114

00:05:06,360 --> 00:05:09,780

understanding of what you're saying okay

115  
00:05:08,069 --> 00:05:11,430  
we never know that's part of the

116  
00:05:09,779 --> 00:05:14,189  
mind-body problem and the problem of

117  
00:05:11,430 --> 00:05:14,490  
other minds we assume other people have

118  
00:05:14,189 --> 00:05:16,079  
my

119  
00:05:14,490 --> 00:05:19,110  
mine's although often times when you're

120  
00:05:16,079 --> 00:05:22,439  
on the highway you're not so sure okay

121  
00:05:19,110 --> 00:05:25,050  
how do we define consciousness well this

122  
00:05:22,439 --> 00:05:27,410  
is a very vague sort of rough and ready

123  
00:05:25,050 --> 00:05:29,400  
definition I came up with on the fly

124  
00:05:27,410 --> 00:05:31,050  
everybody's got their own version of

125  
00:05:29,399 --> 00:05:32,879  
this but I'd say it's the mental

126  
00:05:31,050 --> 00:05:36,449  
experience of perceiving intending

127  
00:05:32,879 --> 00:05:37,620  
apprehending and attending to okay now

128  
00:05:36,449 --> 00:05:39,030  
there's lots of words in there that need

129  
00:05:37,620 --> 00:05:40,649  
further definition before you know what

130  
00:05:39,029 --> 00:05:42,839  
the heck I'm talking about so I'm going

131  
00:05:40,649 --> 00:05:45,750  
to defer to Susan here again for a

132  
00:05:42,839 --> 00:05:48,989  
moment and this is from another paper

133  
00:05:45,750 --> 00:05:51,389  
she wrote on consciousness and I'm going

134  
00:05:48,990 --> 00:05:53,728  
to read from this and you can see you

135  
00:05:51,389 --> 00:05:55,470  
can follow along she says I felt happily

136  
00:05:53,728 --> 00:05:57,060  
into consciousness yesterday walking

137  
00:05:55,470 --> 00:05:59,460  
high on the Devon cliffs with the

138  
00:05:57,060 --> 00:06:01,978  
seagulls crying overhead the grass

139  
00:05:59,459 --> 00:06:04,859  
brushing against my boots was so well

140  
00:06:01,978 --> 00:06:06,750  
grassy it was green and lush and

141  
00:06:04,860 --> 00:06:11,490  
glistening and changing all the time as

142  
00:06:06,750 --> 00:06:15,180  
I strode along this grassiness was my

143

00:06:11,490 --> 00:06:18,598  
experience only I had just this vision

144  
00:06:15,180 --> 00:06:20,848  
from just this point of view yet I also

145  
00:06:18,598 --> 00:06:23,250  
believe that I have objectively realize

146  
00:06:20,848 --> 00:06:25,139  
that taken light and objectively

147  
00:06:23,250 --> 00:06:29,490  
existing brain cells in my head that

148  
00:06:25,139 --> 00:06:31,228  
make me see but how can this be how can

149  
00:06:29,490 --> 00:06:33,840  
objective things like brain cells

150  
00:06:31,228 --> 00:06:35,699  
produce subjective experiences like the

151  
00:06:33,839 --> 00:06:38,698  
feeling that I am striding through the

152  
00:06:35,699 --> 00:06:41,038  
grass and that of course is the problem

153  
00:06:38,699 --> 00:06:44,639  
of consciousness for philosophy of mind

154  
00:06:41,038 --> 00:06:48,240  
for psychology how is it that brain

155  
00:06:44,639 --> 00:06:51,569  
cells hardwired functional kinds of

156  
00:06:48,240 --> 00:06:53,668  
entities in a physical brain how can

157  
00:06:51,569 --> 00:06:56,430

they produce the experiences we have

158

00:06:53,668 --> 00:06:58,620

when we have a conscious experience

159

00:06:56,430 --> 00:06:59,968

there seems to be a disconnect and it's

160

00:06:58,620 --> 00:07:01,889

been addressed in a couple of different

161

00:06:59,968 --> 00:07:04,259

ways David Shaw more calls it almost

162

00:07:01,889 --> 00:07:06,090

calls it the hard problem the problem to

163

00:07:04,259 --> 00:07:11,610

try and figure out how you can explain

164

00:07:06,089 --> 00:07:15,448

how things feel in terms of F MRI and

165

00:07:11,610 --> 00:07:17,098

EEG and firing of synapses and all of

166

00:07:15,449 --> 00:07:20,699

that kind of stuff that that we try and

167

00:07:17,098 --> 00:07:23,430

explain everything else in terms of joe

168

00:07:20,699 --> 00:07:26,189

levine calls it the explanatory gap but

169

00:07:23,430 --> 00:07:27,930

it is essentially the same problem okay

170

00:07:26,189 --> 00:07:30,000

so one

171

00:07:27,930 --> 00:07:31,439

of getting is that this was by thomas

172  
00:07:30,000 --> 00:07:33,750  
nagel had this interesting little

173  
00:07:31,439 --> 00:07:36,060  
article ii basically what is it like to

174  
00:07:33,750 --> 00:07:37,769  
be a bat and so oftentimes people refer

175  
00:07:36,060 --> 00:07:41,250  
to consciousness as the experience of

176  
00:07:37,769 --> 00:07:44,788  
what it is like to be you or to be me or

177  
00:07:41,250 --> 00:07:46,680  
to be anyone else they the interesting

178  
00:07:44,788 --> 00:07:48,569  
metaphor here was okay a bat there's a

179  
00:07:46,680 --> 00:07:50,759  
certain way it is to be a bat and it's

180  
00:07:48,569 --> 00:07:52,349  
not like being a human and yet the

181  
00:07:50,759 --> 00:07:57,120  
things that distinguish being a bat from

182  
00:07:52,350 --> 00:07:59,939  
being a human are these kind of non

183  
00:07:57,120 --> 00:08:02,038  
definable things experience what they

184  
00:07:59,939 --> 00:08:05,009  
call phenomenal experiences or qualia

185  
00:08:02,038 --> 00:08:06,538  
house i'll use the term very often here

186  
00:08:05,009 --> 00:08:09,449  
okay so these are the things that go

187  
00:08:06,538 --> 00:08:11,848  
into making up what it's like experience

188  
00:08:09,449 --> 00:08:13,710  
alright perception the standard sensual

189  
00:08:11,848 --> 00:08:15,659  
perception the sensory input then

190  
00:08:13,709 --> 00:08:18,209  
processed by the brain and producing

191  
00:08:15,660 --> 00:08:21,060  
these experiences cognition the

192  
00:08:18,209 --> 00:08:23,250  
processing of information phenomenal

193  
00:08:21,060 --> 00:08:27,240  
experience the actual experiences we

194  
00:08:23,250 --> 00:08:29,538  
have of red or pain or the smell of

195  
00:08:27,240 --> 00:08:33,528  
cinnamon and those kinds of things and

196  
00:08:29,538 --> 00:08:36,028  
intentionality the the sense we have of

197  
00:08:33,528 --> 00:08:38,219  
relating to the rest universally a sense

198  
00:08:36,028 --> 00:08:41,820  
of about mrs. Brentano called it where

199  
00:08:38,219 --> 00:08:44,070  
when we regard a glass full of water we

200

00:08:41,820 --> 00:08:46,500  
are aware of that thing as an object as

201  
00:08:44,070 --> 00:08:49,440  
an entity in itself sitting there in a

202  
00:08:46,500 --> 00:08:51,330  
way that isn't isn't expressible we just

203  
00:08:49,440 --> 00:08:52,830  
we just know it's there and we're aware

204  
00:08:51,330 --> 00:08:56,970  
of that that's a kind of aboutness that

205  
00:08:52,830 --> 00:08:58,709  
is the root of intentionality so we

206  
00:08:56,970 --> 00:09:00,300  
address the first question very

207  
00:08:58,708 --> 00:09:02,338  
inadequately what is consciousness let's

208  
00:09:00,299 --> 00:09:03,750  
talk about this a second question that's

209  
00:09:02,339 --> 00:09:06,720  
perhaps more important to this lecture

210  
00:09:03,750 --> 00:09:09,120  
why is consciousness in trouble why is

211  
00:09:06,720 --> 00:09:11,129  
it that conscious and the consciousness

212  
00:09:09,120 --> 00:09:14,759  
needs hope why is it the consciousness

213  
00:09:11,129 --> 00:09:17,578  
needs help why is sigh not of any help

214  
00:09:14,759 --> 00:09:18,929

to consciousness what's the problem okay

215

00:09:17,578 --> 00:09:21,750

so here's the threat to consciousness

216

00:09:18,929 --> 00:09:24,299

well the threat conscious rather is the

217

00:09:21,750 --> 00:09:27,179

threat to mind itself it goes back to a

218

00:09:24,299 --> 00:09:30,359

much bigger argument whether mind just

219

00:09:27,179 --> 00:09:32,489

is the brain whether what we perceive as

220

00:09:30,360 --> 00:09:35,190

our mental experiences are nothing more

221

00:09:32,490 --> 00:09:37,200

than the end product of a whole bunch of

222

00:09:35,190 --> 00:09:39,600

neuronal firings and electrochemical

223

00:09:37,200 --> 00:09:41,160

processes and and stimulation

224

00:09:39,600 --> 00:09:43,110

stimulation of nerve

225

00:09:41,159 --> 00:09:46,198

and all that kind of thing if the mind

226

00:09:43,110 --> 00:09:48,300

is only that then it's just the brain or

227

00:09:46,198 --> 00:09:50,008

whether the mind itself is something

228

00:09:48,299 --> 00:09:53,068

unique and something over and above that

229

00:09:50,009 --> 00:09:55,440

at least in some respects and the fight

230

00:09:53,068 --> 00:09:56,958

started out with just mind vs brain way

231

00:09:55,440 --> 00:10:01,850

back starting with Descartes and

232

00:09:56,958 --> 00:10:01,849

proceeding up to today but over