

1
00:00:00,000 --> 00:00:05,730
the session is physics sigh and

2
00:00:03,388 --> 00:00:08,009
interpretation the first speaker is

3
00:00:05,730 --> 00:00:10,349
Steven Brody stubborn brat Steven Brody

4
00:00:08,009 --> 00:00:12,809
and I want to mention that not only is

5
00:00:10,349 --> 00:00:14,460
Ian professor and chair of philosophy at

6
00:00:12,808 --> 00:00:17,429
the University of Maryland but is also

7
00:00:14,460 --> 00:00:20,000
we all know him as the editor of the jse

8
00:00:17,429 --> 00:00:22,859
but we should also note that this is a

9
00:00:20,000 --> 00:00:25,589
period of transition for the entire

10
00:00:22,859 --> 00:00:28,740
field because it's appropriate that a

11
00:00:25,589 --> 00:00:30,509
philosopher may the editor of the

12
00:00:28,739 --> 00:00:32,399
jayasinghe because we have such a wide

13
00:00:30,510 --> 00:00:34,679
ranging interest that figure has matured

14
00:00:32,399 --> 00:00:37,558
in such a sitter in such a way that

15
00:00:34,679 --> 00:00:39,988
someone like Stephen body is literally

16
00:00:37,558 --> 00:00:42,628
perfect for shepherding us into the the

17
00:00:39,988 --> 00:00:44,699
new age of of our field so he'll be

18
00:00:42,628 --> 00:00:49,039
talking about preliminary investigation

19
00:00:44,700 --> 00:00:51,840
on the felix circle thank you very much

20
00:00:49,039 --> 00:00:59,820
it's very strange there's a phosphor to

21
00:00:51,840 --> 00:01:02,340
feel appropriate for anything as many we

22
00:00:59,820 --> 00:01:04,198
probably know the late nineteenth and

23
00:01:02,340 --> 00:01:07,020
early twentieth century was the heyday

24
00:01:04,198 --> 00:01:08,640
of the Spiritualist movement and during

25
00:01:07,019 --> 00:01:10,640
that time there is a great deal of

26
00:01:08,640 --> 00:01:13,319
mediumistic activity going on and

27
00:01:10,640 --> 00:01:15,329
mediumistic activity occurred in two

28
00:01:13,319 --> 00:01:17,548
primary flavors that would be mental

29

00:01:15,329 --> 00:01:20,478
mediumship and physical mediumship

30
00:01:17,549 --> 00:01:22,950
mental mediumship roughly had to do with

31
00:01:20,478 --> 00:01:25,530
channeling communications ostensibly

32
00:01:22,950 --> 00:01:29,159
from the deceased physical mediumship

33
00:01:25,530 --> 00:01:31,259
had to do with it was also thought of as

34
00:01:29,159 --> 00:01:32,759
dealing with a kind of communication

35
00:01:31,259 --> 00:01:35,099
from the deceased but it had to do with

36
00:01:32,759 --> 00:01:37,590
the production of observable physical

37
00:01:35,099 --> 00:01:40,349
phenomena like object levitations at

38
00:01:37,590 --> 00:01:44,609
porting one object from one location to

39
00:01:40,349 --> 00:01:48,209
another levitations materializations and

40
00:01:44,609 --> 00:01:50,849
rapping sounds in the sands table or

41
00:01:48,209 --> 00:01:53,699
around the room you don't see a lot of

42
00:01:50,849 --> 00:01:55,228
this anymore there are the reasons for

43
00:01:53,700 --> 00:01:56,790

that but we can't go into that now there

44

00:01:55,228 --> 00:01:58,480
are still spiritualist groups around

45

00:01:56,790 --> 00:02:00,160
most the spirits

46

00:01:58,480 --> 00:02:03,040
this groups are not particularly

47

00:02:00,159 --> 00:02:04,989
interested in being investigated however

48

00:02:03,040 --> 00:02:08,550
I found that there was a group in hanau

49

00:02:04,989 --> 00:02:11,620
Germany not far from Frankfurt

50

00:02:08,550 --> 00:02:13,270
consisting of spiritists more than

51

00:02:11,620 --> 00:02:15,700
spiritualist they didn't subscribe to

52

00:02:13,270 --> 00:02:17,620
the spiritualist religion but many of

53

00:02:15,699 --> 00:02:19,389
them were interested spiritists they

54

00:02:17,620 --> 00:02:22,509
believed that they were nevertheless

55

00:02:19,389 --> 00:02:25,209
communicating with the deceased and they

56

00:02:22,509 --> 00:02:28,329
were interested in being investigated so

57

00:02:25,210 --> 00:02:30,189
I got myself to hand out so let me tell

58
00:02:28,330 --> 00:02:34,690
you a little bit about the felix circle

59
00:02:30,189 --> 00:02:36,069
i was founded in 2005 originally they

60
00:02:34,689 --> 00:02:37,979
were interested in just the table

61
00:02:36,069 --> 00:02:41,169
tilting phenomena and they had been

62
00:02:37,979 --> 00:02:42,519
reading at least some of the key members

63
00:02:41,169 --> 00:02:44,799
of the group had been reading works by

64
00:02:42,520 --> 00:02:48,280
ken bachelor and others about conducting

65
00:02:44,800 --> 00:02:51,010
table tilting seances and they sought

66
00:02:48,280 --> 00:02:55,060
not so much as dealing with spirits as a

67
00:02:51,009 --> 00:02:57,399
kind of psychokinesis by committee there

68
00:02:55,060 --> 00:03:00,909
are two million people in the group and

69
00:02:57,400 --> 00:03:02,590
then a bunch of the regulars one is the

70
00:03:00,909 --> 00:03:05,219
medium the main medium and then the

71
00:03:02,590 --> 00:03:08,349
circle leader the medium is a

72
00:03:05,219 --> 00:03:10,389
documentary filmmaker the circle leader

73
00:03:08,349 --> 00:03:12,129
is a well-known cardiologist in Germany

74
00:03:10,389 --> 00:03:15,189
works at the Max Planck Institute in at

75
00:03:12,129 --> 00:03:17,500
several hospitals he's not ready to

76
00:03:15,189 --> 00:03:19,989
reveal his identity for pretty obvious

77
00:03:17,500 --> 00:03:21,759
reasons they're both very knowledgeable

78
00:03:19,989 --> 00:03:25,030
about the original mediumistic

79
00:03:21,759 --> 00:03:27,909
literature and the the basic bodies of

80
00:03:25,030 --> 00:03:30,189
evidence and they're also very familiar

81
00:03:27,909 --> 00:03:32,079
with the secondary literature in fact

82
00:03:30,189 --> 00:03:36,099
the circulator this is slightly

83
00:03:32,080 --> 00:03:37,930
embarrassing but I think apart from my

84
00:03:36,099 --> 00:03:39,250
early writings and temporal logic and

85
00:03:37,930 --> 00:03:41,680
the philosophy of time he's read

86

00:03:39,250 --> 00:03:45,900
everything I've ever written so what's

87
00:03:41,680 --> 00:03:49,360
not to love and he joined the group in

88
00:03:45,900 --> 00:03:51,219
2007 most of the other regular sitters

89
00:03:49,360 --> 00:03:54,940
and they range between five and nine

90
00:03:51,219 --> 00:03:57,550
they're more enthusiasts and they're

91
00:03:54,939 --> 00:03:59,050
relatively uncritical and they have two

92
00:03:57,550 --> 00:04:01,660
kinds of sciences they have some

93
00:03:59,050 --> 00:04:03,580
classical spiritualist seances where the

94
00:04:01,659 --> 00:04:05,650
medium sits in a curtain Dolph area

95
00:04:03,580 --> 00:04:09,100
the cabinet and then various things

96
00:04:05,650 --> 00:04:12,039
issue from there and then they do table

97
00:04:09,099 --> 00:04:14,590
sittings and i attended one of each and

98
00:04:12,039 --> 00:04:16,389
i want to describe them to you they're

99
00:04:14,590 --> 00:04:19,480
the cabinet seances the medium is

100
00:04:16,389 --> 00:04:22,300

apparently possessed by the personality

101

00:04:19,480 --> 00:04:26,230

of the lake parapsychologist hans bender

102

00:04:22,300 --> 00:04:28,120

I need to mention that the medium is

103

00:04:26,230 --> 00:04:29,770

pretty sophisticated about this he knows

104

00:04:28,120 --> 00:04:31,300

the hypnosis literature he's read my

105

00:04:29,769 --> 00:04:34,000

book a multiple personality he knows

106

00:04:31,300 --> 00:04:35,710

something about association he doesn't

107

00:04:34,000 --> 00:04:38,290

really believe it's Hans bender but he

108

00:04:35,709 --> 00:04:41,469

respects the entity or the side of his

109

00:04:38,290 --> 00:04:43,960

self that is nevertheless taking over at

110

00:04:41,470 --> 00:04:45,910

these times during the seance so who

111

00:04:43,959 --> 00:04:47,589

realize there's nothing evidential about

112

00:04:45,910 --> 00:04:49,689

Holmes bender that comes through the

113

00:04:47,589 --> 00:04:53,169

medium recognizes this really could just

114

00:04:49,689 --> 00:04:55,060

be a kind of alter ego so there were two

115
00:04:53,170 --> 00:04:57,759
investigators myself and Peter Mirage

116
00:04:55,060 --> 00:04:59,280
from Vienna we had the benefit of a

117
00:04:57,759 --> 00:05:00,849
grant from the Gilbert Raleigh fund

118
00:04:59,279 --> 00:05:03,039
administered by the pair of

119
00:05:00,850 --> 00:05:04,990
psychological association among other

120
00:05:03,040 --> 00:05:07,480
things the grant paid for a couple of

121
00:05:04,990 --> 00:05:09,639
Sony high-definition 0x infrared

122
00:05:07,480 --> 00:05:12,400
camcorders that we hope to use and

123
00:05:09,639 --> 00:05:14,860
documenting the phenomena the middle of

124
00:05:12,399 --> 00:05:16,418
a circle leader however were a little

125
00:05:14,860 --> 00:05:18,280
worried about this first of all they

126
00:05:16,418 --> 00:05:19,810
were concerned that introducing two

127
00:05:18,279 --> 00:05:22,269
investigators into the group would

128
00:05:19,810 --> 00:05:23,560
radically change the psychodynamics of

129

00:05:22,269 --> 00:05:26,189

the group and it might have an

130

00:05:23,560 --> 00:05:28,660

inhibitory effect on the phenomena and

131

00:05:26,189 --> 00:05:31,899

they had that kind of experience before

132

00:05:28,660 --> 00:05:36,189

and the thought that introducing

133

00:05:31,899 --> 00:05:40,389

camcorders even in zero light would be

134

00:05:36,189 --> 00:05:42,519

another negative factor so Peter I

135

00:05:40,389 --> 00:05:44,050

agreed with the medium and the circle

136

00:05:42,519 --> 00:05:46,299

leader that the most important thing

137

00:05:44,050 --> 00:05:47,620

initially was the first of all get

138

00:05:46,300 --> 00:05:49,120

familiar with the members of the group

139

00:05:47,620 --> 00:05:52,030

so that they feel comfortable with us

140

00:05:49,120 --> 00:05:54,699

and then to see a good example of the

141

00:05:52,029 --> 00:05:56,529

phenomena in the Norris robust way that

142

00:05:54,699 --> 00:05:58,360

they were accustomed to experiencing it

143

00:05:56,529 --> 00:06:02,439
we wanted to see what it was that they

144
00:05:58,360 --> 00:06:04,180
were so excited about and if they felt

145
00:06:02,439 --> 00:06:06,129
comfortable at any point in allowing us

146
00:06:04,180 --> 00:06:07,980
to document with our camcorders so much

147
00:06:06,129 --> 00:06:09,899
the better and we fell

148
00:06:07,980 --> 00:06:13,560
was an absolutely necessary first step

149
00:06:09,899 --> 00:06:15,000
in coming to grips with the phenomena

150
00:06:13,560 --> 00:06:17,399
that they were getting and we could

151
00:06:15,000 --> 00:06:20,600
always come back later if the situation

152
00:06:17,399 --> 00:06:22,799
warranted it and impose tighter controls

153
00:06:20,600 --> 00:06:25,860
this is the house where it all takes

154
00:06:22,800 --> 00:06:27,329
place this is the home of a mediums

155
00:06:25,860 --> 00:06:31,410
family the medium lives across the

156
00:06:27,329 --> 00:06:33,449
street the sales location is in the

157
00:06:31,410 --> 00:06:38,750

basement it's in what used to be a bomb

158

00:06:33,449 --> 00:06:42,329

shelter it's a small space this is the

159

00:06:38,750 --> 00:06:44,220

the area in the basement where the

160

00:06:42,329 --> 00:06:46,439

cabinet is and the cabinet again is just

161

00:06:44,220 --> 00:06:48,510

a skirt and off area it's closed when

162

00:06:46,439 --> 00:06:51,209

the mediums inside and at various points

163

00:06:48,509 --> 00:06:54,449

he lifts the curtains apart and things

164

00:06:51,209 --> 00:06:56,009

happen which I'll describe to you these

165

00:06:54,449 --> 00:06:59,129

are some of the objects used in the

166

00:06:56,009 --> 00:07:01,560

séances there's first of all this

167

00:06:59,129 --> 00:07:03,990

trumpet one of the things the old

168

00:07:01,560 --> 00:07:06,060

spiritualist Sciences is that trumpets

169

00:07:03,990 --> 00:07:08,579

were reported to float around the room

170

00:07:06,060 --> 00:07:11,040

this trumpet is made of paper covered

171

00:07:08,579 --> 00:07:13,469

with plastic tape there's a luminous

172
00:07:11,040 --> 00:07:15,900
strip on the end so you can see it in

173
00:07:13,470 --> 00:07:19,020
darkness see its movement anyway and

174
00:07:15,899 --> 00:07:20,579
this is a luminous plaque placed on top

175
00:07:19,019 --> 00:07:24,419
of the condo broom and various things

176
00:07:20,579 --> 00:07:26,310
happen there as well so the phenomena

177
00:07:24,420 --> 00:07:29,100
that I experienced during the cabinets

178
00:07:26,310 --> 00:07:30,750
and this was in total darkness first of

179
00:07:29,100 --> 00:07:33,080
all there was a wind chime hanging in

180
00:07:30,750 --> 00:07:35,430
the center of the circle and we heard

181
00:07:33,079 --> 00:07:38,849
after the medium was apparently

182
00:07:35,430 --> 00:07:41,360
possessed we heard some very mild

183
00:07:38,850 --> 00:07:43,830
tinkling of the wind chime and then rats

184
00:07:41,360 --> 00:07:45,930
were coming from all on the seance room

185
00:07:43,829 --> 00:07:47,370
from behind me from above me all sides

186
00:07:45,930 --> 00:07:52,259
of the room moving around quite quickly

187
00:07:47,370 --> 00:07:54,329
in a kind of ratatat tat quality there

188
00:07:52,259 --> 00:07:57,569
was no room to stand behind any of the

189
00:07:54,329 --> 00:07:59,009
sitter's to produce these sounds I felt

190
00:07:57,569 --> 00:08:01,529
various touches even though we were

191
00:07:59,009 --> 00:08:04,019
holding hands at the time I had on a

192
00:08:01,529 --> 00:08:05,459
short sleeve shirt and I felt on my arms

193
00:08:04,019 --> 00:08:08,279
something that didn't feel flesh like

194
00:08:05,459 --> 00:08:10,169
but it felt solid not sure what it was I

195
00:08:08,279 --> 00:08:12,609
make no claims about it other than that

196
00:08:10,170 --> 00:08:15,819
we saw a variety of theories on

197
00:08:12,610 --> 00:08:18,490
plak usually further like shapes at

198
00:08:15,819 --> 00:08:20,889
various ports handkerchief was placed on

199
00:08:18,490 --> 00:08:24,038
the plaque and the finger like shapes

200

00:08:20,889 --> 00:08:25,629
would pull the handkerchief off then we

201
00:08:24,038 --> 00:08:28,568
saw movements of the trumpet the trumpet

202
00:08:25,629 --> 00:08:30,669
was lifted off the floor it moved around

203
00:08:28,569 --> 00:08:32,649
the circle the large end with the

204
00:08:30,668 --> 00:08:33,968
luminous trip was porting individually

205
00:08:32,649 --> 00:08:35,559
toward each of the circle members

206
00:08:33,969 --> 00:08:37,719
because they each reported that it came

207
00:08:35,559 --> 00:08:39,218
toward them directly when it came to me

208
00:08:37,719 --> 00:08:41,140
it came right up to me I thought it was

209
00:08:39,219 --> 00:08:42,250
going to hit me in the face but it must

210
00:08:41,139 --> 00:08:45,610
have been only about an inch from my

211
00:08:42,250 --> 00:08:48,370
face and it stopped there and then you

212
00:08:45,610 --> 00:08:50,230
saw some ectoplasm okay which was

213
00:08:48,370 --> 00:08:51,940
material emanating ostensibly from the

214
00:08:50,230 --> 00:08:53,289

medium and I want to tell you a little

215

00:08:51,940 --> 00:08:55,510

bit more about that but let me first

216

00:08:53,289 --> 00:08:57,549

show you some drawings made by one of

217

00:08:55,509 --> 00:09:01,179

the sitters I couldn't have done this

218

00:08:57,549 --> 00:09:02,828

myself this is Russell what the finger

219

00:09:01,179 --> 00:09:09,189

like shapes look like on top of the

220

00:09:02,828 --> 00:09:12,069

luminous plaque then this happened so we

221

00:09:09,190 --> 00:09:15,640

were instructed by Hans bender to count

222

00:09:12,070 --> 00:09:17,440

backwards from 15 and then at five the

223

00:09:15,639 --> 00:09:20,198

circle leader would turn on a red light

224

00:09:17,440 --> 00:09:22,240

and the medium was supposed to lift the

225

00:09:20,198 --> 00:09:25,539

curtains apart and we'd see what we'd

226

00:09:22,240 --> 00:09:27,970

see so we kind of back from 15 at five

227

00:09:25,539 --> 00:09:29,799

the lot was turned on and we saw this

228

00:09:27,970 --> 00:09:32,379

hand coming out of the mediums mouth who

229
00:09:29,799 --> 00:09:35,259
was white it ended few inches down on

230
00:09:32,379 --> 00:09:36,669
the wrist and the light was left on for

231
00:09:35,259 --> 00:09:39,669
a few seconds then it was turned off

232
00:09:36,669 --> 00:09:42,578
again we counted backwards from fifteen

233
00:09:39,669 --> 00:09:44,349
one more time at five the light was

234
00:09:42,578 --> 00:09:46,088
turned on and we saw this at this point

235
00:09:44,350 --> 00:09:50,459
the thing coming out of the mouth had

236
00:09:46,089 --> 00:09:52,779
extended all the way to the floor and

237
00:09:50,458 --> 00:09:54,789
then we turned off the light again we

238
00:09:52,778 --> 00:09:57,070
try to one more time and what we saw the

239
00:09:54,789 --> 00:10:00,099
next time was nothing in the mouth but

240
00:09:57,070 --> 00:10:02,829
there is this white unrealistic hand

241
00:10:00,100 --> 00:10:09,220
moving on top of the mediums left

242
00:10:02,828 --> 00:10:11,979
shoulder okay now this was not taken on

243

00:10:09,220 --> 00:10:14,850
this occasion at a science shortly

244

00:10:11,980 --> 00:10:17,329
thereafter the circle leader tried

245

00:10:14,850 --> 00:10:20,269
photographing similar phenomena

246

00:10:17,328 --> 00:10:22,219
under the red light and this I show you

247

00:10:20,269 --> 00:10:24,169
I make no claims about this but this is

248

00:10:22,220 --> 00:10:27,949
roughly what it was looking like at the

249

00:10:24,169 --> 00:10:29,778
time so this is presumably some stuff

250

00:10:27,948 --> 00:10:33,528
some stuff coming from the mediums mouth

251

00:10:29,778 --> 00:10:35,899
with the aid of the medium this is a

252

00:10:33,528 --> 00:10:40,879
picture of a hand apparently just coming

253

00:10:35,899 --> 00:10:45,318
out of the the mediums mouth and this

254

00:10:40,879 --> 00:10:47,119
one as I understand it the hand here it

255

00:10:45,318 --> 00:10:49,219
doesn't quite look like a human hand and

256

00:10:47,119 --> 00:10:51,439
the understanding of those who are

257

00:10:49,220 --> 00:10:54,199
attending at seance was that this was a

258
00:10:51,438 --> 00:10:57,919
spear hand that was moving the curtain

259
00:10:54,198 --> 00:11:03,318
slightly aside now you probably have

260
00:10:57,919 --> 00:11:05,149
some concerns about all of this oh these

261
00:11:03,318 --> 00:11:08,118
are some efforts we can't talk about

262
00:11:05,149 --> 00:11:10,458
that now so let me do a kind of point

263
00:11:08,119 --> 00:11:12,829
counterpoint on some of the perfectly

264
00:11:10,458 --> 00:11:14,988
reasonable skeptical concerns first of

265
00:11:12,828 --> 00:11:16,638
all about the rapping sounds one thing

266
00:11:14,989 --> 00:11:18,829
you need to know is that the cities were

267
00:11:16,639 --> 00:11:20,629
asked to be noisy ostensibly to

268
00:11:18,828 --> 00:11:25,099
encourage the phenomena this was part of

269
00:11:20,629 --> 00:11:27,980
the bachelor door protocol to tell jokes

270
00:11:25,100 --> 00:11:31,278
sing songs keep it very light don't get

271
00:11:27,980 --> 00:11:32,808

too invested in success or failure or in

272

00:11:31,278 --> 00:11:35,208
assuming responsibility for the

273

00:11:32,808 --> 00:11:36,769
phenomena however of course the noise

274

00:11:35,208 --> 00:11:38,238
couldn't ask the movement of someone

275

00:11:36,769 --> 00:11:41,089
moving around trying to produce the

276

00:11:38,239 --> 00:11:42,619
wraps on the other hand there was no him

277

00:11:41,089 --> 00:11:44,869
to stand behind me and most of the

278

00:11:42,619 --> 00:11:46,610
others to produce the wraps and also the

279

00:11:44,869 --> 00:11:49,009
sounds moved quickly around the rule and

280

00:11:46,610 --> 00:11:50,749
the ceiling and as I mentioned making

281

00:11:49,009 --> 00:11:52,789
noise is a familiar technique for

282

00:11:50,749 --> 00:11:53,928
minimizing personal involvement and so

283

00:11:52,789 --> 00:11:57,338
on so there's nothing inherently

284

00:11:53,928 --> 00:11:59,629
suspicious in asking for the noise

285

00:11:57,339 --> 00:12:01,879
regarding the trumpet again the cities

286
00:11:59,629 --> 00:12:03,528
were asked to be noisy but of course the

287
00:12:01,879 --> 00:12:05,778
noise could mask the movement of someone

288
00:12:03,528 --> 00:12:07,759
carrying the trumpet around the circle

289
00:12:05,778 --> 00:12:09,438
and at that point the collar groom and

290
00:12:07,759 --> 00:12:11,178
the plaque had been moved away so there

291
00:12:09,438 --> 00:12:13,578
actually was room for someone to stand

292
00:12:11,178 --> 00:12:16,668
in the middle of the circle to move the

293
00:12:13,578 --> 00:12:18,198
object around on the other hand I take a

294
00:12:16,668 --> 00:12:20,539
reasonable question is how could someone

295
00:12:18,198 --> 00:12:22,039
have managed to come so close to each of

296
00:12:20,539 --> 00:12:24,918
the sitter's faces in total darkness

297
00:12:22,039 --> 00:12:26,838
without touching we saw no evidence of

298
00:12:24,918 --> 00:12:30,220
night vision goggles anywhere in the

299
00:12:26,839 --> 00:12:30,220
room either before afterwards

300
00:12:31,480 --> 00:12:35,240
citizen also asked the type in their

301
00:12:33,679 --> 00:12:37,009
legs and not to reach out into the

302
00:12:35,240 --> 00:12:39,230
circle in order to avoid disturbing the

303
00:12:37,009 --> 00:12:40,759
force of the process of course that

304
00:12:39,230 --> 00:12:42,289
would prevent disturbing someone who is

305
00:12:40,759 --> 00:12:45,230
trying fraudulently to produce the

306
00:12:42,289 --> 00:12:46,939
phenomena on the other hand we heard the

307
00:12:45,230 --> 00:12:49,039
mediums heavy breathing and talking from

308
00:12:46,940 --> 00:12:51,140
within the cabinet throughout most of

309
00:12:49,039 --> 00:12:52,519
all of this and other sitters were also

310
00:12:51,139 --> 00:12:56,179
talking inaudible from their positions

311
00:12:52,519 --> 00:12:57,620
and no props were discovered and also

312
00:12:56,179 --> 00:12:59,509
it's a familiar thing if you read the

313
00:12:57,620 --> 00:13:02,690
old mediumistic literature it's very

314

00:12:59,509 --> 00:13:05,289
familiar to see reports of mediums

315
00:13:02,690 --> 00:13:07,670
crying out in pain when the material

316
00:13:05,289 --> 00:13:11,120
emanating from them is touched or when

317
00:13:07,669 --> 00:13:12,289
the force is disturbed so the medium in

318
00:13:11,120 --> 00:13:13,940
the circle leader were very much

319
00:13:12,289 --> 00:13:16,250
immersed in the literature they knew

320
00:13:13,940 --> 00:13:17,750
that that was a possible danger so again

321
00:13:16,250 --> 00:13:20,330
I don't regard that as inherently

322
00:13:17,750 --> 00:13:23,019
suspicious although it certainly leaves

323
00:13:20,330 --> 00:13:25,460
plenty of room for questions and

324
00:13:23,019 --> 00:13:27,230
regarding the ectoplasm I have to say

325
00:13:25,460 --> 00:13:28,790
there was no opportunity to inspect the

326
00:13:27,230 --> 00:13:30,529
cabinet after the sitting to see if

327
00:13:28,789 --> 00:13:32,779
there were remaining active plasmic

328
00:13:30,529 --> 00:13:35,000

props the medium after being possessed

329

00:13:32,779 --> 00:13:36,500

and coming out of trance is often we're

330

00:13:35,000 --> 00:13:38,090

told physically ill they brought in a

331

00:13:36,500 --> 00:13:40,909

bucket for him to environment into which

332

00:13:38,090 --> 00:13:42,470

he sometimes does we were not showing

333

00:13:40,909 --> 00:13:45,829

the contents of the bucket as far as I

334

00:13:42,470 --> 00:13:49,220

know he didn't vomit this this time on

335

00:13:45,830 --> 00:13:50,570

the other hand not a whole lot except

336

00:13:49,220 --> 00:13:52,340

that I can tell you that nothing was

337

00:13:50,570 --> 00:13:55,070

found in the room inspection prior to

338

00:13:52,340 --> 00:13:57,139

the science the medium was ostensibly

339

00:13:55,070 --> 00:13:58,879

controlled and observed by the circle

340

00:13:57,139 --> 00:14:01,399

leader and by another sitter both of

341

00:13:58,879 --> 00:14:03,740

whom I have no reason to distrust I'll

342

00:14:01,399 --> 00:14:06,649

also say just for the record that for

343
00:14:03,740 --> 00:14:09,830
what it's worth my gut reaction to the

344
00:14:06,649 --> 00:14:12,919
medium and the circle leader is to trust

345
00:14:09,830 --> 00:14:17,690
them on the other hand when I think

346
00:14:12,919 --> 00:14:18,949
about my marital history I have to be

347
00:14:17,690 --> 00:14:24,980
very careful about trusting my gut

348
00:14:18,950 --> 00:14:27,259
reactions so so the conclusion so far is

349
00:14:24,980 --> 00:14:30,320
that we have to suspend judgment about

350
00:14:27,259 --> 00:14:32,330
the cabinet settings the medium use em

351
00:14:30,320 --> 00:14:34,850
the circle leaders preference for lack

352
00:14:32,330 --> 00:14:37,340
of controls it's not inherently

353
00:14:34,850 --> 00:14:38,779
suspicious under the circumstances so

354
00:14:37,340 --> 00:14:40,430
I'd say nothing

355
00:14:38,779 --> 00:14:42,470
physically encouraged suspicion but also

356
00:14:40,429 --> 00:14:45,229
nothing specifically discouraged

357

00:14:42,470 --> 00:14:47,149

suspicion either so as I said earlier I

358

00:14:45,230 --> 00:14:50,800

see the seance as an essential first

359

00:14:47,149 --> 00:14:50,799

step toward more thorough documentation

360

00:14:50,980 --> 00:14:55,550

all right let me put a little bit about

361

00:14:53,090 --> 00:14:57,950

the table sitting there was first a 20

362

00:14:55,549 --> 00:14:59,959

minute meditation and then the table

363

00:14:57,950 --> 00:15:02,090

started to move in darkness as soon as

364

00:14:59,960 --> 00:15:05,120

all hands were on the table there were 2

365

00:15:02,090 --> 00:15:07,040

45 minute segments the original idea was

366

00:15:05,120 --> 00:15:09,440

to have no recording for the first one

367

00:15:07,039 --> 00:15:11,299

and infrared recording for the second

368

00:15:09,440 --> 00:15:14,300

one however it turned out that one of

369

00:15:11,299 --> 00:15:16,219

the cameras was on accidentally for part

370

00:15:14,299 --> 00:15:20,689

of session one and then deliberately for

371

00:15:16,220 --> 00:15:23,000
session too we got ematic we had two

372
00:15:20,690 --> 00:15:24,290
cameras for the second session one of

373
00:15:23,000 --> 00:15:27,500
them aimed under the table the other

374
00:15:24,289 --> 00:15:29,689
above the table there are dramatic table

375
00:15:27,500 --> 00:15:31,820
movements both times but we only had one

376
00:15:29,690 --> 00:15:35,090
full table levitation unfortunately in

377
00:15:31,820 --> 00:15:37,520
total darkness which and no recording

378
00:15:35,090 --> 00:15:38,960
which again seems to support the mediums

379
00:15:37,519 --> 00:15:40,909
and circle leaders concern that

380
00:15:38,960 --> 00:15:44,360
recording might slightly inhibit the

381
00:15:40,909 --> 00:15:46,639
phenomena so let me show you a little

382
00:15:44,360 --> 00:15:49,550
bit of the table movement oh I have to

383
00:15:46,639 --> 00:15:50,870
say about the table levitation this was

384
00:15:49,549 --> 00:15:52,549
quite distinctive for the other table

385
00:15:50,870 --> 00:15:55,279

movements the table movements were quite

386

00:15:52,549 --> 00:15:59,179

vigorous I think if the room have been

387

00:15:55,279 --> 00:16:00,500

any larger the table would have moved

388

00:15:59,179 --> 00:16:01,939

out of the room I don't have a lot of

389

00:16:00,500 --> 00:16:04,580

time left but I want to show you some of

390

00:16:01,940 --> 00:16:06,740

this stuff so bear with me if it you can

391

00:16:04,580 --> 00:16:09,530

always ask me questions later when the

392

00:16:06,740 --> 00:16:11,120

table levitated it rose straight up

393

00:16:09,529 --> 00:16:13,189

several inches off the ground stayed

394

00:16:11,120 --> 00:16:16,429

there for three or four seconds it was

395

00:16:13,190 --> 00:16:20,120

obvious to all of us that the table top

396

00:16:16,429 --> 00:16:21,769

remain parallel to the floor and there

397

00:16:20,120 --> 00:16:23,480

is no feeling of the table being pushed

398

00:16:21,769 --> 00:16:24,769

or lifted the movement was smooth and

399

00:16:23,480 --> 00:16:26,990

sudden as if the table had suddenly

400
00:16:24,769 --> 00:16:30,439
become weightless weightless it was

401
00:16:26,990 --> 00:16:32,210
quite distinctive this is the setup we

402
00:16:30,440 --> 00:16:35,600
use the darker table for the actual

403
00:16:32,210 --> 00:16:37,160
occasion oh I also have to tell you they

404
00:16:35,600 --> 00:16:42,170
were also looking for what they call

405
00:16:37,159 --> 00:16:43,458
spirit lights I know what you just read

406
00:16:42,169 --> 00:16:46,789
okay so

407
00:16:43,458 --> 00:16:48,859
so they hope to see lights around the

408
00:16:46,789 --> 00:16:50,448
seance room and in fact some lights were

409
00:16:48,860 --> 00:16:51,800
absorbed around my feet and around my

410
00:16:50,448 --> 00:16:55,849
testicles which was a source of

411
00:16:51,799 --> 00:16:58,578
considerable hilarity and it tells that

412
00:16:55,850 --> 00:17:00,230
we there's any lights we saw when we

413
00:16:58,578 --> 00:17:02,388
look at the video afterwards I'm not

414
00:17:00,230 --> 00:17:05,449
going to have time to show you that but

415
00:17:02,389 --> 00:17:08,509
we saw some other anomalous phenomena on

416
00:17:05,449 --> 00:17:10,250
the high-definition video which I'd be

417
00:17:08,509 --> 00:17:21,578
happy to show you later but let me show

418
00:17:10,250 --> 00:17:21,578
you this now feel free to sing along

419
00:17:30,460 --> 00:17:38,288
yeah we're joking about my testimony I'm

420
00:17:35,028 --> 00:17:38,288
there Peter is there

421
00:17:58,190 --> 00:18:00,220
I

422
00:18:06,160 --> 00:18:08,160
ah

423
00:18:57,299 --> 00:19:03,009
okay I think that's probably a good

424
00:19:00,940 --> 00:19:12,130
place to stop and I'm happy to take some

425
00:19:03,009 --> 00:19:13,900
questions when people who want to ask

426
00:19:12,130 --> 00:19:20,380
questions please come up here and speak

427
00:19:13,900 --> 00:19:22,090
into this Mac absolutely fascinating

428

00:19:20,380 --> 00:19:24,370
please tell me you're going to publish

429
00:19:22,089 --> 00:19:28,089
this no I'm not going to publish this

430
00:19:24,369 --> 00:19:30,099
yet I want to wait until we've done a

431
00:19:28,089 --> 00:19:31,569
follow-up investigation where we can do

432
00:19:30,099 --> 00:19:33,399
some more infrared recording because

433
00:19:31,569 --> 00:19:36,819
that's obviously essential for the

434
00:19:33,400 --> 00:19:38,860
cabinet seance I don't recall reading

435
00:19:36,819 --> 00:19:40,419
any literature on cabinet sciences

436
00:19:38,859 --> 00:19:42,369
percent I mean unless you're going back

437
00:19:40,420 --> 00:19:50,620
oh yeah that's what I have to go yeah

438
00:19:42,369 --> 00:19:54,459
great thank you I assume that they under

439
00:19:50,619 --> 00:19:56,079
the table video camera was there among

440
00:19:54,460 --> 00:19:57,789
other things to make sure that nobody

441
00:19:56,079 --> 00:20:00,750
was pushing on the underside of the

442
00:19:57,789 --> 00:20:03,220

table during these antics correct yeah

443

00:20:00,750 --> 00:20:06,039

what I haven't had time to do that is to

444

00:20:03,220 --> 00:20:08,650

coordinate the above camera shots with

445

00:20:06,039 --> 00:20:11,529

the the under camera shots but nothing

446

00:20:08,650 --> 00:20:13,060

untoward was observed and I think next

447

00:20:11,529 --> 00:20:14,619

time they'll try the room is very small

448

00:20:13,059 --> 00:20:15,970

so it was hard to get the kind of angle

449

00:20:14,619 --> 00:20:21,069

we wanted obviously you can't see

450

00:20:15,970 --> 00:20:22,480

everybody's hands so funding print if we

451

00:20:21,069 --> 00:20:24,579

get sufficient funding maybe we can

452

00:20:22,480 --> 00:20:26,920

introduce a third camera so i have two

453

00:20:24,579 --> 00:20:31,210

cameras above the table one underneath

454

00:20:26,920 --> 00:20:35,890

let's see what we can do hi hi um what

455

00:20:31,210 --> 00:20:38,980

are you familiar with other research on

456

00:20:35,890 --> 00:20:41,020

on deceptive methods of doing this type

457
00:20:38,980 --> 00:20:43,720
of thing yeah I know the literature

458
00:20:41,019 --> 00:20:45,220
pretty well again in total darkness

459
00:20:43,720 --> 00:20:46,420
there's not a whole lot you can say

460
00:20:45,220 --> 00:20:48,220
which is why I don't want to reach any

461
00:20:46,420 --> 00:20:52,740
definite conclusions at this stage about

462
00:20:48,220 --> 00:20:54,579
the cabinet seance table levitations are

463
00:20:52,740 --> 00:20:56,079
obviously much more

464
00:20:54,579 --> 00:20:57,668
press of them these kinds of table

465
00:20:56,079 --> 00:21:00,720
movements I don't regard this is

466
00:20:57,669 --> 00:21:04,419
strongly evidential this is just a

467
00:21:00,720 --> 00:21:06,730
genuine interest as a curiosity so it

468
00:21:04,419 --> 00:21:08,259
doesn't prove anything because you know

469
00:21:06,730 --> 00:21:10,120
it's very hard to tell looking at this

470
00:21:08,259 --> 00:21:12,220
what's what the difference is

471
00:21:10,119 --> 00:21:13,989
observational II between the muscular

472
00:21:12,220 --> 00:21:16,390
movement involved in trying to move the

473
00:21:13,990 --> 00:21:19,089
table and the muscular movement involved

474
00:21:16,390 --> 00:21:21,610
or tension involved in trying to keep up

475
00:21:19,089 --> 00:21:25,689
with the table the table tilting

476
00:21:21,609 --> 00:21:27,609
phenomenon is is is has been done in you

477
00:21:25,690 --> 00:21:29,440
know for real by a number of people

478
00:21:27,609 --> 00:21:31,778
however i'm going to say that this

479
00:21:29,440 --> 00:21:33,788
particular video of the table tilting

480
00:21:31,778 --> 00:21:35,500
phenomenon to me as a person who's

481
00:21:33,788 --> 00:21:37,509
familiar with fraudulent methods and

482
00:21:35,500 --> 00:21:40,980
stuff looks like there could be

483
00:21:37,509 --> 00:21:44,048
potential areas that could be absolutely

484
00:21:40,980 --> 00:21:45,399
that I mean it's fascinating by all

485

00:21:44,048 --> 00:21:47,470
means but I'd love for you to talk to me

486
00:21:45,398 --> 00:21:48,788
afterwards well I'll just say I agree

487
00:21:47,470 --> 00:21:53,200
that this is not even remotely

488
00:21:48,788 --> 00:21:54,908
evidential the circle readers hands were

489
00:21:53,200 --> 00:21:57,069
not placed as I would have liked them to

490
00:21:54,909 --> 00:21:58,960
be these people over here had their

491
00:21:57,069 --> 00:22:01,359
hands very lightly on the table the

492
00:21:58,960 --> 00:22:03,069
circle leader allowed is his wrist to

493
00:22:01,359 --> 00:22:04,839
drop so you can't tell whether he's

494
00:22:03,069 --> 00:22:07,089
doing this I think if you study the

495
00:22:04,839 --> 00:22:09,819
video carefully and we have quite a lot

496
00:22:07,089 --> 00:22:12,158
of it it's hard to explain some of the

497
00:22:09,819 --> 00:22:14,168
table movements in terms of the hands

498
00:22:12,159 --> 00:22:15,639
that you can see but there's a lot more

499
00:22:14,169 --> 00:22:26,470

needs to be said thank you very much

500

00:22:15,638 --> 00:22:29,099

thank you our next speaker is Richard

501

00:22:26,470 --> 00:22:29,100

sharp nose