



# Aliens On Earth.com

Resources for those who are stranded here



[UFOs](#) | [Paranormal](#) | [Area 51](#)  
[People](#) | [Places](#) | [Random](#)  
[Top 100](#) | [What's New](#)  
[Catalog](#) | [New Books](#)

Search... for keyword(s)

in Page Titles

Our Bookstore  
is [OPEN](#)

[Mothership](#) -> [UFO](#) -> [Updates](#) -> [1997](#) -> [Jun](#) -> Here

## UFO UpDates Mailing List

### The Carp Case - A Review (Part 5/6)

From: **UFO UpDates - Toronto** <updates@globalserve.net>  
Date: Thu, 05 Jun 1997 06:30:05 -0400  
Fwd Date: Thu, 05 Jun 1997 06:30:05 -0400  
Subject: The Carp Case - A Review (Part 5/6)

Part 5.

Originally published in  
The MUFON Ontario Newsletter  
Volume 1.5 - November 1994

The Carp Case - The MUFON Ontario Version  
by Tom Theofanous & Errol Bruce-Knapp

The Carp Review - Part Five

On May 9th, 1993 Tom, Lise and Graham drove to Almonte to talk to Bobby (Guardian) Charlebois without success. The following day Oechsler called Graham and was very upset at the attempt to talk to Charlebois which puzzled Graham.

May 28th Graham and Oechsler met with Gary Osterbrook a polygrapher. Oechsler and Osterbrook had agreed on a price of a thousand dollars to conduct two lie-detector tests - one on Diane Labenek the other with Susan ('Sarah Janille') Gill - Oechsler's mysterious 'Canadian Government Official'.

Oechsler used one of of Bruce Maccabee's personal cheques made out for \$1,000 (US) which he gave to Osterbrook as payment for the testing.

In 1993, 'The Air Report' (Associated Investigator's Report #1) raised the issue of Maccabee's possibly using The Fund for UFO Research's money for personal gain:

[quote]

Dr. Maccabee has made at least one trip to Ontario to investigate the case. It is not known whether any Fund for UFO Research monies were expended in this investigation.

[quote ends]

Maccabee responded in his 'Rebuttal Paper', page 18 item 27:

[quote]

....a simple question which could have been answered before the publication [of the 'Air Report'] by a simple phone call to the Chairman, Richard Hall, or to any of the other members of the Executive Board. The

answer is NO (a thousand times, no).

[quote ends]

An odd choice of words. Surely a coincidence? A check, signed by him, for \$1,000.00 to Gary Osterbrook the polygrapher? "The answer is NO (a thousand times No.)"!

Bruce Maccabee, the Maryland State Director for MUFON, and MUFON's crack photographic and video-analyst supposedly had no interest in the Carp Case other than analysing the Guardian Video - he declared it to be an 'authentic' landed UFO, on television!

More from 'THE AIR REPORT'

[quote]

Dr. Maccabee also maintains a relationship with Robert Oechsler, a man whose motives in the field are at best mercenary. He has at one point or another involved himself in virtually every aspect of ufology. Mr. Oechsler has been variously described as a clown, a fraud and even a con-man (in 1991 he attempted to involve several of his then friends in the UFO field in some sort of bizarre pyramid scheme in which participants were to send him money via Federal Express (so as to avoid federal laws governing mail fraud)--telling at least one associate that he intended to make several hundred thousand dollars). Mr. Oechsler who represents himself as a former "NASA Mission Specialist" has participated with Dr. Maccabee in the photographic analysis of the Gulf Breeze material.

[Commander Gene Cernan USN (Retd. and former NASA astronaut, reported that Oechsler had NEVER held the position he claims in NASA, but that it was possible that he had worked as a junior technician either with NASA or with a NASA sub-contractor, in which case his name would not have been known anyway.)]

Mr. Oechsler has also made a series of fantastic claims concerning his alledged discoveries of various secret government UFO related projects including an operational anti-gravity chamber, sophisticated anti-alien defense installations, a wide-ranging program to educate the general public as to the reality of the UFO phenomenon and others too tedious to detail here. These "discoveries" were published by Timothy Good in his book "Alien Liaison" in England and more recently in "Alien Contact" here in the United States. It is virtually certain that most if not all of Mr. Oechsler's claims are fraudulent and he has intimated to Walt Andrus, International Director of the Mutual UFO Network, that he fabricated at least some of the material.

The most important point here is not Oechsler's selling of this material to the television shows 'Unsolved Mysteries' and 'Sightings' but Dr. Maccabee's clear support for the validity of the case. Dr. Maccabee spoke in support of the authenticity of the Guardian video on at least one television program and before the large audience of a UFO conference in Silver Spring, MD.

Richard Hall, the Fund's (for UFO Research) newly elected chairman, also said that he was equally perplexed by some of the UFO cases that Maccabee had promoted such as Gulf Breeze and the "Guardian" case.

[quote ends]

To which Maccabee responded in his 'Hot Air' rebuttal:

[quote]

The writer charges that my support for UFO cases which, in the mind of the writer at least, are "obviously" poor cases or frauds (New Zealand, Kirtland Landing Case, Gulf Breeze, Guardian) has caused other

researchers to waste time and money carrying out their own investigations. (How horrible!)

[quote ends]

Not just in the mind of the writer of the 'Air Report' but also on the lips of many of ufology's leading lights. Not 'horrible!', just an immense waste of time, energy and money on a patent hoax. And how callous of a man who for many years was trusted and respected by his peers.

Bruce Maccabee's motive and actions throughout the course of Oechsler's investigation are highly suspect and we feel that Maccabee owes an explanation to all those in our field who have trusted his judgment over the years.

The question is, is Maccabee being manipulated by Oechsler? Is he being conned or have his judgement and analytical capabilities become desperately impaired?

During the May 28th, meeting between Bob Oechler, Graham Lightfoot and Gary Osterbrook, Susan Gill was introduced to Graham for the first time. Gill is the External Affairs 'witness' to the event that took place in the Labanek's field.

Her story or at least one version that she has given:

On a rainy night Susan Gill's dog began barking at the front window and she got up to see what was being barked at. As she looked through her window she noticed, through the trees that border her lot, a set of peculiar red lights glowing across the road in the Labanek's field - she assumed they were fireworks. Other coloured lights rose up over the treetops and instantly vanished. When she did not see any fireworks explode she got curious and went out to her driveway to take a closer look. Suddenly in front and above her was an object with swirling lights. As the object descended she tried, unsuccessfully to get back into her house and she claims that the Labanek dogs could be heard "barking up a storm in the distance" - this despite the fact that on the Guardian video only one dog is heard and only in the view of the 'craft' with the flares extinguished.

Weeks later Gill recalled in detail being abroad the craft and conversing telepathically with the alien occupants and an oriental looking 'being' in charge.

She also remembered a car going by in front of her house just after a helicopter flew over the Labanek's field. She has given several different versions of the car and driver story: It was the Guardian who stopped to ask her if she was OK, another that he stopped and was very rude to her and yet another story that she thought it might have been the Guardian but took note of his licence number anyway despite the fact that she was very groggy and the car speeding away.

Gill claims that on the night she had these experiences it was raining, which on investigation proved to be the night before Diane Labanek and the Guardian claimed to have seen and videoed the 'landed craft'. But, what is most intriguing is Gill's ability to see through the deep stand of thick, tall spruce trees between her and the 'landing site' in the Labanek's field.

Gill is adamant about dogs barking - both hers and the Labaneks, despite the fact that on the Guardian video only one dog is heard and only in the view of the 'craft' with the flares extinguished.

Recently, Gill told our investigators that she was sure that her 'event' took place on "a rainy night", which she maintains was the night before Labanek's 'sighting'. The Guardian video shows neither rain nor wetness which leads us to believe that either Labanek and Guardian were lying or Susan Gill was making up her story.

Gill sent a signed letter to a third party (who wishes to remain anonymous) complaining about "Graham Lightfoot and his associates".

She wrote:

[quote]

Mr. Lightfoot first presented himself as having a professional background as a reporter and as a serious UFO Investigator. I had indicated that I was writing a book involving UFOs, Aliens, Psychic Phenomena, a female abductee and an investigator and showed him not only the first chapters but also the story line. Although fictitious characters and incidents are in the story and it is to be published as fiction I'm disturbed by Mr. Lightfoot's indiscretion at revealing it's contents.

[quote ends]

It's strange that Gill would denounce Graham in her letter since she had already shown both her story and outline to Oechsler - he had it when Graham first met Gill.

Why would she be so upset with something that she thought Graham had done when she already knew Oechsler had the story ready to go to print in the 'UFO Library' magazine? She was present when Graham read over Oechsler's copy for the magazine and also Bob left his name out. She was not at all concerned that Bob was using her story, and never suggested that she as at any subsequent meeting with Graham.

If, as Gill writes "fictitious characters and incidents are in the story and it is to be published as fiction" - why did Oechsler treat her story as fact, connecting it in the October/November 1993 issue of 'UFO Library' to The Guardian Story?

In the second paragraph of his 'Insiders Report', Oechsler used part of the opening chapter of Gill's novel without giving her a writer's credit - curiously, the same parts of her book that she claims Graham was indiscreet about. None of the 'facts' in this paragraph of Oechsler's "surrealistic screams, excruciating cries of tormented agony that warned off all attempts by residents to investigate, startling screams like no other sound experienced before by anyone..." have been reported or verified. We can only point out that these facts are the opening of Susan Gill's Horror Novel.

In the letter Gill also complained that:

[quote]

Derogatory remarks are being made by Mr. Lightfoot and his Associates a out Mr. Oechler and myself that are unacceptable and are sufficient grounds for a lawsuit.

[quote ends]

The third party replied in a letter to Susan Gill:

[quote]

Please be advised that I am in receipt of your signed letter of the above date. Please be advised also that I have taken your letter very seriously.

As you so correctly pointed out in your letter it is not wise to go by hearsay, for instance, I have been led to believe that all along and from many independent sources that you were indeed victim of the extraordinary phenomenon known as 'UFO Abduction' and was suprised to learn from your letter that a misunderstanding has occurred.

I was not aware that your only participation in the events that transpired in you neighborhood was by way of research for a book of fiction you wre writing as opposed to a personal experience.

May I apologize for this misconception and stress that I will indeed pass you message on to whoever I hear expressing an incorrect view on this matter. Had you chosen to simply write to set the record straight about the above, I would have been agreeable to respect your total confidentiality.

Good luck in your work of fiction.

[quote ends]

Gill has not responded to the preceding letter and all of this begs the question: How valid were the lie-detector tests on Gill? Unless of course the questions asked of her during the polygraph testing skirted around the situation or that she is a confabulator (a pathological liar) - someone who believes what they are saying even if the events they describe never happened. Of course we can only surmise!

Diane Labanek was also scheduled to take a polygraph test but changed her mind at the last minute - perhaps realising that she might not 'pass'. By that time there were many people asking a lot of questions about her involvement in the Guardian Capers.

---

[The following are excerpts from Armen Victorian's August 1991 Review of Chapter 10 of 'Alien Liaison' by Timothy Good and associated documentation & correspondence, posted on an InterNet Computer Conference - AltParaUFO on 20 April 1994. The name Armen Victorian is a pseudonym of an energetic British researcher.]

Timothy Good's latest book, was published by Century in May, 1991. Soon afterward, Mr. Good received wide media coverage largely due to ONE chapter in his book which added "punch" to make it a best seller.

In England, he appeared on TV programs and 'live' radio shows, which, via satellite link, also helped to bring his close associate, Mr. Bob Oechsler into the limelight. Bob Oechsler provided the main substance for 'Cosmic Journey' - Chapter 10.

In the conversation I had with Oechsler on 10 August 1991, when it was becoming clear that many areas in Chapter 10 raised very serious questions, he said that I should know by now that Good is not a researcher, but an editor who collects material and puts it together...

...I then contacted Mr. Robert W. Kirchgessner, who was the Director of Special Development Group, Ringling Bros. & Barnum and Bailey, at that time.

Mr. Kirchgessner, with his direct answers, cast a great deal of light on the subject matter, thereby revealing the length and breadth of distortions Good and Oechsler went to present THEIR own version of 'Cosmic Journey'.

I asked Mr. Kirchgessner to describe what took place in the course of their contacts with Oechsler and Good.

He said: "Robert Oechsler's situation is ah, let me put it like this... Robert Oechsler was recommended to us by Timothy Good, we met with the man ONE time. We determined very very quickly that he was a total INCOMPETENT."

"This fact was illustrated when the gentleman approached us, coming in and telling us everything from the fact that he could deliver us a UFO, to whether he had a government agency watching him."

"We were sitting in a restaurant here in Orlando with him. We invited him down here, paying all his costs, to speak to him....."

[This particular factor was confirmed to me by Mr. Robert Kenneston, in a separate telephone conversation with him in his Los Angeles office, on 12 Aug. 1991 {tape recorded conversation}. Mr. Kenneston was a witness to that meeting, and held a separate discussion with Oechsler, as part of the same meeting.]

".....trying to do the best research that we could. And he perceives and comes out with the statement that the CIA people are tracking him and they were sitting and watching him in the restaurant."

"The man was...he was not in touch with reality at the time in my opinion. We had elected not to proceed with him in any way,

shape or form. The only question that I felt remaining with the call that I received regarding Robert Oechsler, was whether or not somebody else in the Ringling Corporation had hired him to do additional research without my knowledge. Which was always possible within our company".

Author: "Yes, Mr. Chuck Smith..."

"...right, Chuck Smith was my immediate superior. Chuck met various people, he usually would utilize them to continue to look into subject matters, if they had any knowledge at all. To my knowledge at this time, he had never spoken to nor had he been in communication with, nor had gone any further than my initial confidential report to him, stating that this (Mr. Oechsler) is one gentleman that we should NOT do business with. And to this date that is the position that Chuck has taken in regards to this."

I asked Mr. Kirchgessner how Timothy Good became involved? He replied that they decided not to have anything to do with Good due to the high fees he had asked for.

Mr. Kirchgessner's answer to this question is quite contradictory to what Good has written in his book.

On page 151 of 'Alien Liasons', Good writes:

[Quote]

Following further discussions, I was invited to become the 'Official Consultant on UFO research' to the Special Development group. A personal meeting in Orlando, Florida, was pre-requisite, the director said, and since I would be visiting Gulf Breeze during October, I made arrangements to fly to Orlando. Unfortunately, DIFFICULTIES with airline scheduling arose, allowing inadequate time for the trip, and I was obliged to postpone the meeting.

[quote ends]

I put to Mr. Kirchgessner what Mr. Good had published, he said "It is simply not true, we dropped him because of the sums he was asking as his fees. Then Mr. Robert Oechsler appeared on the horizon."

Mr. Kirchgessner told me that Oechsler had asked for either \$1200 or \$2000 per day for his work (he couldn't remember the exact figure off-hand).

He had added that they asked Captain Gene Cernan, ex-NASA astronaut, who is a director on their Board, to check Oechsler's credentials regarding his NASA background.

Cernan reported that Oechsler had NEVER held the position he claims in NASA, but that it was possible that he had worked as a junior technician either with NASA or with a NASA sub-contractor, in which case his name would not have been known anyway.

I called Gene Cernan on 8 Aug. 1991. After confirming what Mr. Kirchgessner had said was correct, Cernan added that the 'Cosmic Journey' project never went any further than the drawing board. {Taped telephone conversation}.

The day before, 7 Aug. 1991, I contacted Miss Susan Brewer, who works with Mr. Kirchgessner and was a witness to the Orlando meeting, between Oechsler and the Ringling Bros people.

I read her the passage on page 197 of 'Alien Liaison' in which Good states that the project ('Cosmic Journey') had the approval of President Bush and Vice-President Quayle. She answered: "As far as Bob (Kirchgessner) is concerned, when he worked with Gene Cernan, Cernan presented the project to Vice President Quayle representing President Bush, then yes, I would assume it would go to the top."

[Note: The way in which Good has referred to this point in his book adds more vigor to his version of the story, as to 'Cosmic Journey' initially being a government based project].

She further added, "Let me tell you that when Mr. Oechsler came

here to Orlando, I was present. We were very kind and polite, but we realized that he was a little off the wall".

I also put to her what Mr. Kirchgessner had told me about Oechsler's promise to provide them with a genuine UFO. She immediately said, "A genuine UFO plus a spaceship". I asked her whether it was in writing or verbal. She replied "Verbal, but there were four other people at the table, you know, they fell off their chairs!".

I asked if she could give me their names as a matter of record. She answered, "I was one of them, the other young man was Brownell Schlubach. He used to work with us at SDG, Bob Kirchgessner, and the other gentleman's name was Don Branch, the Manager of Design for SDG".

She further added that "after we realized what sort of person we were dealing with, we would not have anything more to do with a person with such a fanatical presentation".

End of Part 5.

---

[ [Next Message](#) | [Previous Message](#) | [This Day's Messages](#) ]  
[ [This Month's Index](#) | [UFO UpDates Main Index](#) | [MUFON Ontario](#) ]

**UFO UpDates - Toronto - [updates@globalserve.net](mailto:updates@globalserve.net)**  
Operated by Errol Bruce-Knapp - ++ 416-696-0304

A Hand-Operated E-Mail Subscription Service for the Study of UFO Related Phenomena.  
To subscribe please send your first and last name to [updates@globalserve.net](mailto:updates@globalserve.net)  
Message submissions should be sent to the same address.

---

[ [UFO Topics](#) | [People](#) | [Ufomind What's New](#) | [Ufomind Top Level](#) ]

**To find this message again in the future...**  
Link it to the appropriate [Ufologist](#) or [UFO Topic](#) page.

Archived as a public service by [Area 51 Research Center](#) which is not responsible for content.  
Software by Glenn Campbell. Technical contact: [webmaster@ufomind.com](mailto:webmaster@ufomind.com)

Financial support for this web server is provided by the [Research Center Catalog](#).