



# Aliens On Earth.com

Resources for those who are stranded here



**Our Bookstore is OPEN**

*Over 5000 new & used titles, competitively priced!*

Topics: [UFOs](#) - [Paranormal](#) - [Area 51](#) - [Ghosts](#) - [Fortean](#) - [Conspiracy](#) - [History](#) - [Biography](#) - [Psychology](#) - [Religion](#) - [Crime](#) - [Health](#) - [Geography](#) - [Maps](#) - [Science](#) - [Money](#) - [Language](#) - [Recreation](#) - [Technology](#) - [Fiction](#) - [Other](#) - [New](#)

Search... for keyword(s)

in Page Titles

[Mothership](#) -> [UFO](#) -> [Updates](#) -> [1998](#) -> [Jul](#) -> Here

## UFO UpDates Mailing List

### Re: Mag 1/4 -- Comments on Trindade Isl. 2/2

From: Jerry Cohen <[rjcohen@li.net](mailto:rjcohen@li.net)>  
Date: Tue, 30 Jun 1998 14:23:20 -0400  
Fwd Date: Wed, 01 Jul 1998 09:03:05 -0400  
Subject: Re: Mag 1/4 -- Comments on Trindade Isl. 2/2

>From: The Duke of Mendoza <[101653.2205@compuserve.com](mailto:101653.2205@compuserve.com)> [Peter Brookesmith]  
>Date: Fri, 26 Jun 1998 22:53:23 -0400  
>Fwd Date: Sat, 27 Jun 1998 10:53:47 -0400  
>Subject: MAGONIA ETH Bulletin #4

>>From: " Jerry Cohen " <[rjcohen@li.net](mailto:rjcohen@li.net)>  
>>Date: Sun, 17 May 1998 22:48:21 -0400  
>>Fwd Date: Mon, 18 May 1998 10:11:25 -0400  
>>Subject: Re: MAGONIA ETH Bulletin 01

>>>From: Mendoza <[101653.2205@compuserve.com](mailto:101653.2205@compuserve.com)> [Peter Brookesmith]  
>>>Date: Sat, 16 May 1998 17:43:46 -0400  
>>>Fwd Date: Sun, 17 May 1998 11:29:27 -0400  
>>>Subject: MAGONIA ETH Bulletin 01

-----  
Continued from: "Mag 1/4\_\_Comments on Trindade Isl.1"

As in part 1, please note, "MAGONIA ETH Bulletin 01" will be abbreviated to "M".

We also know the following from the Blue Book report:

5. Publicity. The press reports after the publication of the photographs covered a great deal of newspaper space for about a week, tending to prove or disprove the authenticity of Baruna's photographs. DIARIO CARICCA reported that personnel of SALDANHA were under rigid orders of silence.

JC:If this were true it wouldn't surprise me since all this attention by news media had to be taking away from the normal course of daily business of the people involved.

Everything we have said so far summates to the reason for my stated belief...

>>It seems rather obvious to me that people did see it. Whether >>they would admit it to the newspapers, that is another story, >>especially when we realize who the people were.

>>....snip....At least some if not most of the possible >>witnesses aboard were scientists. Would you risk your career >>as a scientist participating in world-wide IGY experiments to >>say you saw this, even if you did? We know how scientists are: >>if you don't have something solid or the numbers and data to >>prove it, it doesn't exist. Who would know better than another

>>scientist?

JC:We see these same sentiments echoed time and time again in various posts from UFO skeptics who are honestly attempting to follow scientific principles. (i.e. if you can't prove it by repeatable experiments, "it isn't.") Any scientists who receive government funding, reading these posts, care to comment? Be 100% honest. If you saw it and had no other proof other than a photograph(s), would you say this to the newspapers? Remember, "be honest."

BTW, on another incredibly long shot, are there any witnesses who were on the ship during the sighting who would like to make a comment here? If any of these people are still alive and reading this list, perhaps they may be of retirement age, not have to worry about grants, etc. and might possibly want to set the record straight.

I also pointed out that Dr. J. Allen Hynek's following comments, made after approximately twenty years of study on the topic, also support what I have said in this regard:

>>Hynek, J. Allen "The UFO Experience" Henry Regnery Company  
>>1972, hardcover

>>Chapter 1  
>>The Laughter of Science

>>p.9"the most coherent and articulate UFO reports come  
>>from people who have not given much thought to the subject and  
>>generally who are surprised and shocked by their experience."

>>p.9"some of the very best reports have come from  
>>scientifically trained people..... These reports are usually  
>>rarely published however, because the person usually requests  
>>anonymity."

M's author says the following...

>>> If there really were many witnesses, then the photographs  
>>>are hardly likely to be fakes. If there were no witnesses,  
>>>it is difficult to see how people could be fooled by a  
>>>photographer who purported to take pictures of something  
>>>which nobody else noticed from the crowded deck of a ship.

JC:In light of the all the facts we've examined so far, it seems to me, the incongruity M's author has just presented us with is the exact reason this case should not be summarily dismissed without a further serious in-depth, accurate investigation made concerning the specific points addressed by this researcher. There appears to be enough evidence to conclude there probably were witnesses.

Perhaps this is an inconclusive case to this point, so be it. But I would hope reasonable people can understand why the case shouldn't be simply written off as conclusive evidence the case was hoaxed.

Additionally, regarding M's author's observations re Dr. Menzel's comments on the photographs, and perhaps the bottom line to all this...

>>>Dr Menzel  
>>>originally thought the photographs showed an aircraft flying  
>>>through cloud, but eventually claimed that they were faked.

JC:As I was trying to indicate in my 17 May post, "Where can we find his proof that they were faked?" Did he do a photographic analysis of the photos? Has anyone, and what did it show? We all know "claiming" and "proving" are two different things. If it's been proven, we're all entitled to see it.

Finally, regarding the Trindade photos, M's author said...

>>> And if you are a sceptic it depends whether you  
>>>believe the photographs were faked or that they are genuine

>>>and that they portray an aircraft or some natural phenomenon.

JC:My reply to this:

- 1) What aircraft of earthly origins back in the 1950's, or today, has the configuration displayed in the Trindade photographs?
- 2) To what exact phenomenon is M's author referring?
- 3) How was the supposed faking accomplished with, what appears to be, a high probability of witness confirmation?

Respectfully,  
Jerry Cohen

Author: Oberg/Cooper rebuttals  
Website: <http://www.li.net/~rjcohen/>  
UFOMind: <http://www.ufomind.com/ufo/people/c/cohen/>

P.S. Full Blue Book report on the Brazilian Navy survey ship Almirante Saldanha UFO sighting, off Trindade Island, as it appears in Dr. Hynek's "UFO Report" can be found at:

[http://www.li.net/~rjcohen/Trindade\\_Hynek.html](http://www.li.net/~rjcohen/Trindade_Hynek.html)  
Dr. Hynek's comments preface and conclude the report

SOURCES OF INFORMATION: Look Magazine Special . FLYING SAUCERS . pub. by Editors of United Press International and Cowles Communications, Inc., Belleville, Lance . UPI Rio de Janeiro "Ola o disco!" : also, Hynek, Allen J.: "The Hynek UFO Report" . New York . Dell Publishing Co., Inc. 1977 . chapter 10 "The Brazilian UFO Photos"

-----  
Interestingly, for those interested, there are two military cases which happened approximately 2 1/2 months prior to Trindade; Kirtland & Sebago. I verified their exact dates and times with Jan Aldrich, Project 1947 and discovered they had actually occurred closer in time to each other than I originally thought.

- - KIRTLAND/SEBAGO DATES & TIMES - -  
> Kirkland AFB, NM 10:45-11:04 pm MST 4 Nov  
>  
> Sebago 05:10-05:21 am 5 Nov

That places them about 5 hours apart.

Their summaries & newspaper articles can be found beginning at <http://www.li.net/~rjcohen/ocr.7a.html#Anchor>  
see 7a, 7b, 7c

---

[ [Next Message](#) | [Previous Message](#) | [This Day's Messages](#) ]  
[ [This Month's Index](#) | [UFO UpDates Main Index](#) | [MUFON Ontario](#) ]

**UFO UpDates - Toronto - [updates@globalserve.net](mailto:updates@globalserve.net)**  
Operated by Errol Bruce-Knapp - ++ 416-696-0304

A Hand-Operated E-Mail Subscription Service for the Study of UFO Related Phenomena.  
To subscribe please send your first and last name to [updates@globalserve.net](mailto:updates@globalserve.net)  
Message submissions should be sent to the same address.

---

[ [UFO Topics](#) | [People](#) | [Ufomind What's New](#) | [Ufomind Top Level](#) ]

**To find this message again in the future...**  
Link it to the appropriate [Ufologist](#) or [UFO Topic](#) page.

Archived as a public service by [Area 51 Research Center](#) which is not responsible for content.  
Software by Glenn Campbell. Technical contact: [webmaster@ufomind.com](mailto:webmaster@ufomind.com)

Financial support for this web server is provided by the [Research Center Catalog](#).